#### Notes

## Chapter 1: Defining Feminism, Religion, and the Study of Religion

- 1. William E. Paden, Religious Worlds: The Comparative Study of Religion (Boston: Beacon Press, 1988), p. 38.
- 2. New Webster's Dictionary of the English Language (n.p.: Delair Publishing Co., 1981).
- 3. Simone de Beauvoir, *The Second Sex* (New York: Bantam Books, 1961), p. xv.
- Gerda Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986).
- 5. For further discussion of the topic, see my forthcoming article "Helping the Iron Bird Fly: Buddhist Women and Issues of Authority in the Late 1990s," in *Contemporary American Buddhism*, ed. Charles Prebish (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997).

# Chapter 2: Feminism's Impact on Religion and Religious Studies: A Brief History

- 1. From the title of the book by Eleanor Flexner, Century of Struggle: The Women's Rights Movement in the United States, rev. ed. (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1975).
- 2. Ralph Manheim, trans., Myth, Religion, and Mother Right: Selected Writings of J. J. Bachofen (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1967), p. 109.

- 3. Ibid., p. 171.
- 4. Barbara MacHaffie, Her Story: Women in Christian Tradition (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1986), pp. 93-95.
- 5. For example, see Anne M. Boylan, "Evangelical Womanhood in Nineteenth-Century America: The Role of Women in Sunday Schools," in *Unspoken Worlds: Women's Religious Lives*, ed. Nancy Auer Falk and Rita M. Gross (Belmont, Calif.: Wadsworth Press, 1989), pp. 166–78.
  - 6. MacHaffie, Her Story, pp. 107-12.
- 7. Ibid., pp. 123–25. See also Susan Setta, "When Christ Is a Woman: Theology and Practice in the Shaker Tradition," in Gross and Falk, *Unspoken Worlds*, pp. 221–32.
  - 8. Ibid., p. 125.
  - 9. Ibid., p. 127.
  - 10. Flexner, Century of Struggle, pp. 45-48.
- 11. Elise Boulding, The Underside of History: A View of Women through Time (Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1976), pp. 678-79; Mac-Haffie, Her Story, pp. 101-2; and Miriam Schneir, ed., Feminism: The Essential Historical Writings (New York: Vintage Books, 1972), pp. 76-82.
  - 12. Schneir, Feminism, pp. 76-82.
- 13. Elizabeth Cady Stanton and the Revising Committee, *The Woman's Bible* (Seattle: 1895, 1898; reprint, Coalition Task Force on Women and Religion, 1974), p. 14. See also MacHaffie, *Her Story*, pp. 113—16.
  - 14. Ibid.
  - 15. Boulding, Underside of History, p. 758.
- 16. One of the most famous and widely quoted of such role reversals was by Nelle Morton, "Preaching the Word," in Sexist Religion and Women in the Church: No More Silence, ed. Alice Hageman (New York: Association Press, 1974), pp. 29–31.
- 17. Cynthia Eller, Living in the Lap of the Goddess: The Feminist Spirituality Movement in America (New York: Crossroad, 1993), p. 47.
- 18. Rosemary Ruether, "Christianity and Women in the Modern World," in *Today's Woman in World Religions*, ed. Arvind Sharma (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993), p. 279.
  - 19. For an excellent survey and bibliography concerning women's

ordination, see Barbara Brown Zikmund, "Women and Ordination," in In Our Own Voices: Four Centuries of American Women's Religious Writing, ed. Rosemary Ruether and Catherine Keller (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1995), pp. 291–340.

- 20. MacHaffie, *Her Story*; Ruether, "Christianity and Women in the Modern World."
- 21. Rosemary Radford Ruether, Women-Church: Theology and Practice of Feminist Liturgical Communities (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1986), pp. 3-4.
- 22. Judith Plaskow and Joan Arnold Romero, ed., Women and Religions, rev. ed. (Missoula, Mont.: Scholars Press, 1974); Rita M. Gross, ed., Beyond Androcentrism: New Essays on Women and Religion (Missoula, Mont.: Scholars Press, 1977).
- 23. Important works by each include Beverly Wildung Harrison, Making the Connections: Essays in Feminist Social Ethics (Boston: Beacon Press, 1985); Nelle Morton, The Journey Is Home (Boston: Beacon Press, 1985); and Letty M. Russell, Human Liberation in a Feminist Perspective—A Theology (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1974).
- 24. Christine Downing, "Dear Chris... Love, Christine," in A Time to Weep, a Time to Sing: Faith Journeys of Women Scholars of Religion, ed. Mary Jo Meadow (Minneapolis: Winston Press, 1985), p. 60.
- Valerie Saiving, "The Human Situation: A Feminine View," in Womanspirit Rising: A Feminist Reader in Religion, ed. Carol P. Christ and Judith Plaskow (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1979), pp. 25–42.
- 26. For a classic form of the statement, see Rosemary Ruether, "Misogynism and Virginal Feminism in the Fathers of the Church," in *Religion and Sexism: Images of Woman in the Jewish and Christian Traditions*, ed. Rosemary Ruether (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1974), pp. 150–83.
- 27. Editorial Policy Statement, vol. 1 of *The Annual Review of Women in World Religions* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1991).
  - 28. Christ and Plaskow, Womanspirit Rising, p. 15.
- 29. Rosemary Ruether, "A Religion for Women," *Christianity and Crisis*, 10 December, 1979, pp. 307–10; Rosemary Ruether, "Goddesses and Witches: Liberation and Countercultural Feminism," *Christian Century*,

10-17 September 1980, pp. 842-47; Carol P. Christ, Laughter of Aphrodite: Reflections on a Journey to the Goddess (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1987), pp. 57-72.

- 30. Ruether and Keller, In Our Own Voices, p. 446.
- 31. Ibid., p. 448.
- 32. Ursula King, Feminist Theology from the Third World: A Reader (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1994), p. 13; Ruether and Keller, In Our Own Voices, pp. 430-31.
  - 33. King, Feminist Theology from the Third World, p. 394.
- 34. Riffat Hassan, "Muslim Women and Post-Patriarchal Islam," in After Patriarchy: Feminist Transformations of the World Religions, ed. Paula Cooey, William Eakin, and Jay McDaniel (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1991).
- 35. Lina Gupta, "Kali the Savior," in Cooey, Eakin, and McDaniel, After Patriarchy; Vashuda Narayan, in Feminist Transformations of the World Religions, ed. Arvind Sharma (forthcoming).
- 36. These generalizations are gleaned from reading Arvind Sharma's *Today's Woman in World Religions* (see note 18), an excellent, up-to-date source of information on these movements.
- 37. Nancy Auer Falk, "Shakti Ascending: Hindu Women, Politics, and Religious Leadership during the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries," in *Religion in Modern India*, ed. Robert Baird (New Delhi: Motilal Barnasidas, 1995).
- 38. Katherine K. Young, "Women in Hinduism," in Sharma, *Today's Woman in World Religions*, p. 128.
  - 39. Ibid., pp. 128-31.
- 40. Jane I. Smith, "Women in Islam," in Sharma, Today's Woman in World Religions, p. 306.
  - 41. Ibid., p. 322.
- 42. Miriam Levering, "Women, the State, and Religion Today in the People's Republic of China," in Sharma, *Today's Woman in World Religions*, p. 175.
  - 43. Ibid., pp. 174-91.
  - 44. Ibid., p. 172.
  - 45. Ibid., pp. 203-24.

- 46. Barbara Reed, "Women and Chinese Religion in Contemporary Taiwan," in Sharma, *Today's Woman in World Religions*, pp. 226–37.
  - 47. Ibid., pp. 237-41.
- 48. Kumiko Uchino, "The Status Elevation Process of Soto Sect Nuns in Modern Japan," in Speaking of Faith: Global Perspectives on Women, Religion, and Social Change, ed. Diana L. Eck and Devaki Jain (Philadelphia: New Society Publishers, 1987), pp. 159-73.
- 49. At the Sun Dance, those who have vowed to do so have skewers placed beneath the skin; the skewers are also tied to the sacred tree at the center of the circle. As the participants dance, they pull backward from the tree until the skewers break loose. For men, the skewers are placed in the upper chest. When women first began to participate in the Sun Dance, they did not pierce, but recently some women, commanded to do so by a vision, have had skewers placed beneath the skin of their upper arms.
- 50. Paula Gunn Allen, The Sacred Hoop: Recovering the Feminine in American Indian Traditions (Boston: Beacon Press, 1986), pp. 5-6.
- 51. Inés Talamantez, "Images of the Feminine in Apache Religious Tradition," in Cooey, Eakin, and McDaniel, *After Patriarchy*, p. 131.

#### Chapter 3: Where Have All the Women Been? The Challenge of Feminist Study of Religion

- 1. Rita M. Gross, "Menstruation and Childbirth as Ritual and Religious Experience," in Falk and Gross, *Unspoken Worlds*; Rita M. Gross, "Tribal Religions: Aboriginal Australia," in *Women in World Religions*, ed. Arvind Sharma (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1987).
- 2. Diane Bell, *Daughters of the Dreaming* (North Sydney, Australia: McPhee Grible/George Allen and Unwin, 1983).
- 3. Eleanor McLaughlin, "The Christian Past: Does It Hold a Future for Women?" in Christ and Plaskow, Womanspirit Rising, p. 96.
- 4. An early account of such rituals is found in Falk and Gross, *Unspoken Worlds*, pp. 59–92.
- 5. See Peggy Reeves Sanday, Female Power and Male Dominance: On the Origins of Sexual Inequality (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1981), pp. 28–33.

- 6. Falk and Gross, Unspoken Worlds, pp. 212-20.
- 7. See chapters 6-8 and 10-12 of Falk and Gross, *Unspoken Worlds*, for examples.
  - 8. Ibid., pp. 106-7.
  - 9. Ibid., p. 133.
  - 10. Ibid., p. xv.
- 11. For example, see chapters 10–12 of Falk and Gross, *Unspoken Worlds*.
- 12. Rita M. Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy: A Feminist History, Analysis, and Reconstruction of Buddhism (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993).
  - 13. McLaughlin, "The Christian Past," pp. 94-95.
  - 14. Ibid., p. 95.
- 15. For example, following McLaughlin's suggestion, many scholars have investigated the many woman mystics who were so important to medieval Christianity.
  - 16. Gross, Buddhism After Patriarchy, p. 118.
- 17. For one example, see Elizabeth A. Johnson, She Who Is: The Mystery of God in Feminist Theological Discourse (New York: Crossroads, 1991), pp. 76–103. Virginia Ramey Mollenkott has systematically collected and studied these images in The Divine Feminine: The Biblical Imagery of God as Female (New York: Crossroad, 1984).
- 18. Caroline Walker Bynum, Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982).
- 19. These arguments will be presented in more detail in a forthcoming article by Rita M. Gross, "Toward a New Model of the Hindu Pantheon" in *Religion*.
- 20. An important early article was Phyllis Trible, "Eve and Adam: Genesis 2–3 Reread," in Christ and Plaskow, Womanspirit Rising, pp. 74–83. See also Phyllis Trible, God and the Rhetoric of Sexuality (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1978) and Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza, Bread Not Stone: The Challenge of Feminist Biblical Interpretation (Boston: Beacon Press, 1984).
- 21. Frances Dahlberg, Woman the Gatherer (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1981) and Sally Slocum, "Woman the Hunter: Male Bias in

Anthropology," in *Toward an Anthropology of Women*, ed. Ranya Reiter (New York and London: Monthly Review Press, 1975), pp. 36–50.

- 22. Shirley Strum, Almost Human: A Journey into the World of Baloons (New York: Random House, 1987).
- 23. Nancy Jay, Throughout Your Generations Forever: Sacrifice, Religion, and Paternity (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992).
- 24. Unfortunately, this thesis represents almost the sum total of thinking about women and religions of even someone so great as the late Mircea Eliade. His widely read book *Rites and Symbols of Initiation: The Mysteries of Birth and Rebirth* (New York: Harper and Row, 1958) uses this thesis to focus on differences between men's and women's patterns and experiences of initiation. For an early feminist discussion of this hypothesis, see Sherry B. Ortner, "Is Female to Male as Nature Is to Culture?" in *Woman, Culture, and Society*, ed. Michelle Zimbalist Rosaldo and Louis Lamphere (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1974).
- 25. For example, see chapters 11 and 12 of Falk and Gross, *Unspoken Worlds*.
- 26. See Karen McCarthy Brown, Mama Lola: A Vodou Priestess in Brooklyn (Stanford/Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991); Bell, Daughters of the Dreaming; Erika Friedl, Women of Deh Koh: Lives in an Iranian Village (Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1989); and Kathleen M. Erndl, Victory to the Mother: The Hindu Goddess of Northwest India in Myth, Ritual, and Symbol (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1993). See also Susan Starr Sered, Religions Dominated by Women (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1993).
  - 27. Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy.
- 28. George Buhler, trans., *The Laws of Manu* (New York: Dover Publications, 1969), especially pp. 195–98.
- 29. See especially Susan Wadley, "Hindu Women's Family and Household Rites in a North Indian Village," and James M. Freeman, "The Ladies of Lord Krishna: Rituals of Middle-Aged Women in Eastern India," in Falk and Gross, *Unspoken Worlds*, pp. 572–92.
- 30. Raphael Patai, *The Hebrew Goddess* (New York: Avon Books, 1978), and Mollenkott, *The Divine Feminine*.
  - 31. Many popular books on goddesses, often of questionable schol-

arly accuracy, have appeared. Among the most popular and influential of such books is Merlin Stone, When God Was a Woman (New York: Harcourt Brace and Jovanovich, 1978). More recent and more usable surveys on Western goddesses are Elinor Gadon, The Once and Future Goddess, and Anne Baring and Jules Cashford, The Myth of the Goddess: Evolution of an Image (New York: Viking, 1991). Two reliable cross-cultural surveys of goddesses in major religions, both ancient and modern, are David Kinsley, The Goddesses' Mirror: Visions of the Divine from East and West (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989) and Troy Wilson Organ, The Book of the Goddess (New York: Crossroad, 1983). For a survey of Hindu goddesses, see David Kinsley, Hindu Goddesses: Visions of the Divine Feminine in Hindu Religious Tradition (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986).

- 32. Christine Downing, The Goddess: Mythological Images of the Feminine (New York: Crossroad, 1981).
  - 33. Falk and Gross, Unspoken Worlds, pp. 102-11, 125-33.
  - 34. Sharma, Women in World Religions, p. 16.
- 35. For a survey of such movements, see Catherine Wessinger, ed., Women's Leadership in Marginal Religions: Explorations outside the Mainstream (Champaign, Ill.: University of Illinois Press, 1993).
  - 36. Falk and Gross, Unspoken Worlds, p. xi.
  - 37. Sanday, Female Power and Male Dominance, p. 232.
  - 38. Ibid., p. 165.
  - 39. Ibid., p. 6.
  - 40. Ibid., p. 171.
  - 41. Ibid., p. 9.
  - 42. Ibid., pp. 210-11.
  - 43. Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy, pp. 312-15.
  - 44. Ibid., pp. 314-15.
- 45. Katherine K. Young, "Hinduism," in Sharma, Today's Woman in World Religions, pp. 119–25.
- 46. Mary Daly, Gyn/Ecology: The Metaethics of Radical Feminism (Boston: Beacon Press, 1978), pp. 109–292.
  - 47. Gross and Falk, Unspoken Worlds, pp. 125-33, 145-54.

### Chapter 4: No Girls Allowed? Are the World's Religions Inevitably Sexist?

- 1. Carol P. Christ, "The New Feminist Theology: A Review of the Literature," *Religious Studies Review* III:4 (October 1977): pp. 203–12.
  - 2. Christ and Plaskow, Womanspirit Rising, p. 9.
- 3. Plaskow and Christ, Weaving the Visions: New Patterns in Feminist Spirituality (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1989), p. 7.
  - 4. Ibid.
- 5. Rosemary Ruether, Sexism and God-Talk: Toward a Feminist Theology (Boston: Beacon Press, 1983), p. 12.
  - 6. Ibid., pp. 18-19.
  - 7. Plaskow and Christ, Weaving the Visions, p. 3.
  - 8. Daly, Beyond God the Father (Boston: Beacon Press, 1973), p. 8.
- 9. See Leonard Grob, Riffat Hassan, and Haim Gordon, Women's and Men's Liberation: Testimonies of Spirit (New York: Greenwood Press, 1991).
  - 10. Ibid., p. 24.
- 11. For a short version of Trible's exegesis, see Trible, "Eve and Adam." See also Trible's "Depatriarchalizing in Biblical Interpretation," *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* (March 1973), pp. 251–58, and *God and the Rhetoric of Sexuality* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press), 1978.
- 12. Leonard Swidler, "Jesus Was a Feminist," *Catholic World* (January 1971), pp. 177–83.
  - 13. Ruether, Sexism and God-Talk, p. 135.
  - 14. See MacHaffie, Her Story, p. 26, for a list.
  - 15. Ibid., pp. 18-21.
  - 16. Hassan, "Muslim Women," pp. 54-57.
  - 17. Ibid., p. 51.
  - 18. Ibid., pp. 44-54.
- 19. Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza, But She Said: Feminist Practices of Biblical Interpretation (Boston: Beacon Press, 1992), p. 156.
  - 20. Schüssler Fiorenza, Bread Not Stone, p. 14.
  - 21. Ibid., p. 159.

NOTES TO PAGES 130-36

- 22. Ibid., pp. 15-22. Also, But She Said, pp. 57-76.
- 23. Rita M. Gross, "Steps toward Feminine Imagery of Deity in Jewish Theology," in *On Being a Jewish Feminist: A Reader*, ed. Susannah Heschel (New York: Schocken Books, 1983), p. 236.
- 24. Rita M. Gross, "Female God Language in a Jewish Context," in Christ and Plaskow, *Womanspirit Rising*, pp. 170–71.
- 25. Gross, "Steps toward Feminine Imagery of Deity in Jewish Theology."
  - 26. Ruether, Sexism and God-Talk, pp. 68-69.
  - 27. Ibid., p. 46.
  - 28. Ibid., pp. 70-71.
- 29. Anne Carr, Transforming Grace: Christian Tradition and Women's Experience (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1988), p. 147.
  - 30. Ibid., p. 148.
  - 31. Ibid., pp. 150-53.
  - 32. Ibid., p. 153.
  - 33. Ibid., pp. 156-57.
- 34. Sallie McFague, Metaphorical Theology: Models of God in Religious Language (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1982).
  - 35. Ibid., p. 167.
  - 36. Ibid., p. 145.
- 37. Sallie McFague, Models of God: Theology for an Ecological, Nuclear Age (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1987), p. ix.
  - 38. Ibid., pp. xi-xiii.
  - 39. Ibid., pp. 101-23.
- 40. Elizabeth Johnson, She Who Is: The Mystery of God in Feminist Theological Discourse (New York: Crossroad, 1993).
  - 41. Ibid., p. 75.
  - 42. Ibid., p. 196.
  - 43. Ibid., p. 243.
- 44. Rita M. Gross, "Female God-Language," in Christ and Plaskow, Womanspirit Rising, p. 173.
- 45. Chung Hyun Kyung, Struggle to Be the Sun Again: Introducing Asian Women's Theology (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1990), p. 48. It is interesting to hear an Asian Christian woman confirm what I had claimed

for years about the impact the rich heritage of non-Western female Godtalk could have on monotheistic religious imaginations.

- 46. Ibid., pp. 48, 50.
- 47. Ibid., p. 48.
- 48. Ibid., p. 64. For an account of traditional Korean shamanism, see Youngsook Kim Harvey, "Possession Sickness and Women Shamans in Korea," in Falk and Gross, *Unspoken Worlds*, pp. 37–44.
- 49. Judith Plaskow, Standing Again at Sinai (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1990), p. 150.
  - 50. Ibid., pp. 152-54.
  - 51. Ibid., pp. 165, 167.
  - 52. Ibid., p. 161.
  - 53. Ibid., pp. 160, 163, 165.
  - 54. Ibid., pp. 155-69.
- 55. For a beautifully written, highly accessible scholarly account of Kali, see David Kinsley, The Sword and the Flute: Kali and Krishna; Dark Visions of the Terrible and the Sublime in Hindu Mythology (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975). For a collection of Hindu devotional poems to Kali, see Ramprasad Sen, Grace and Mercy in Her Wild Hair: Selected Poems to the Mother Goddess, trans. Leonard Nathan and Clinton Seely (Boulder, Colo.: Great Eastern Books, 1982). For an accurate scholarly account of Hindu goddesses in general, see David Kinsley, Hindu Goddesses: Visions of the Divine Feminine in Hindu Religious Tradition (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986).
  - 56. Gupta, "Kali the Savior," p. 16.
  - 57. Ibid., p. 17.
  - 58. Ibid., p. 29.
  - 59. Ibid., p. 24.
  - 60. Ibid., p. 31.
- 61. See Rita M. Gross, "Some Buddhist Perspectives on the Goddess," in *Women and Goddess Traditions*, ed. Karen King (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, forthcoming).
- 62. For a fuller discussion of these "deities," see Gross, *Buddhism after Patriarchy*, pp. 75–77, 102–14, 196–206; and Gross, "Some Buddhist Perspectives on the Goddess."

- 63. See Rita M. Gross, "I Will Never Forget to Visualize That Vajra-yogini Is My Body and Mind," *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion* III:1 (1987): pp. 77–89.
  - 64. See Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy, pp. 105-8, 196-206.
- 65. The statement was made by Nagarjuna, one of the most important Buddhist thinkers of all time, in his *Mulamadyamikakarikas* (Fundamentals of the Middle Way), XXIV:18–19. For a translation and commentary, see Frederick J. Streng, Emptiness: A Study in Religious Meaning (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1967).
- 66. The most important texts are the Vimalakirtinirdasa Sutra and the Srimaladevisimhanada Sutra. The most convenient work in which to study the relevant excerpts is Diana Y. Paul, Women in Buddhism: Images of the Feminine in Mahayana Tradition (Berkeley: Asian Humanities Press, 1979), chapters 6 and 8.
  - 67. From Paul's translation in Women in Buddhism, p. 236.
  - 68. Ibid., p. 188.
  - 69. Ibid., p. 145.
- 70. Mary Daly, The Church and the Second Sex, with a New Feminist Postchristian Introduction by the Author (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1975).
  - 71. Ibid., p. 12.
  - 72. Ibid., p. 14.
  - 73. Ibid., p. 5.
  - 74. Ibid., pp. 9-10.
  - 75. Ibid., p. 51.
  - 76. Daly, Beyond God the Father, p. 9.
  - 77. Ibid., pp. 10-12.
  - 78. Christ, Laughter of Aphrodite.
  - 79. Ibid., p. 105.
  - 80. Ibid., p. 59.
  - 81. Ibid., p. 60.
  - 82. Ibid., p. 67.
  - 83. Ibid., pp. 61-63.
  - 84. Ibid., pp. 117-32.
  - 85. A notable exception is Diana L. Eck's book Encountering God: A

Spiritual Journey from Bozeman to Benares (Boston: Beacon Press, 1993), in which Eck writes of how her study of Hinduism has enriched her Christian faith.

### Chapter 5: Has It Always Been That Way? Rereading the Past

- 1. For a survey of this material, including bibliography, see Mac-Haffie, Her Story.
  - 2. Eller, Living in the Lap of the Goddess, pp. 150-84.
- 3. The phrase is taken from the book title: Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy.
  - 4. Lionel Tiger, Men in Groups (New York: Random House, 1969).
  - 5. George Gilder, Sexual Suicide (New York: Quadrangle, 1973).
- 6. Riane Eisler, *The Chalice and the Blade: Our History, Our Future* (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1987), pp. 24–28.
- 7. David Kinsley, The Goddesses' Mirror: Visions of the Divine Feminine from East and West (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. xviii.
  - 8. Sanday, Female Power and Male Dominance, p. 4.
- 9. Margaret Ehrenberg, Women in Prehistory (Norman, Okla.: University of Oklahoma Press, 1989), pp. 10–66; M. Kay Martin and Barbara Voorhies, Female of the Species (New York: Columbia University Press, 1975), pp. 144–211.
  - 10. Martin and Voorhies, Female of the Species, p. 190.
- 11. For example, see Sanday, Female Power and Male Dominance, pp. 113-20, 135-43.
  - 12. Ehrenberg, Women in Prehistory, p. 173.
- 13. Elizabeth Gould Davis, *The First Sex* (Baltimore: Penguin Books, 1972), and Merlin Stone, *When God Was a Woman* (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Jovanovich, 1978). Unfortunately, neither of these writers had academic training in any of the disciplines that have contributed to the prepatriarchal hypothesis.
- 14. Anne Barstow, "The Prehistoric Goddess," in *The Book of the Goddess: Past and Present*, ed. Carl Olson (New York: Crossroads, 1983), pp. 7–28.
  - 15. Marija Gimbutas, The Language of the Goddess: Unearthing the

Hidden Symbols of Western Civilization (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1989) and The Civilization of the Goddess: The World of Old Europe (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1991).

- 16. Elinor Gadon, The Once and Future Goddess: A Symbol for Our Time (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1989).
  - 17. Baring and Cashford, The Myth of the Goddess.
  - 18. Christ, Laughter of Aphrodite.
  - 19. Eisler, The Chalice and the Blade, p. 24.
  - 20. Kinsley, The Goddesses' Mirror, pp. xi-xix.
- 21. Katherine K. Young, "Goddesses, Feminists, and Scholars," in The Annual Review of Women in World Religions (1991): pp. 105-79.
- 22. Joan B. Townsend, "The Goddess: Fact, Fallacy, and Revitalization Movement," in *Goddesses in Religions and Modern Debate*, ed. Larry W. Hurtado (Atlanta, Ga.: Scholars Press, 1990), pp. 180–203.
  - 23. Townsend, "The Goddess," p. 197.
- 24. Rosemary Ruether, *Gaia and God* (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1992), pp. 143-65.
  - 25. Townsend, "The Goddess," p. 194.
  - 26. Young, "Goddesses, Feminists, and Scholars," p. 146.
- 27. Thorkild Jacobsen, Treasures of Darkness: A History of Mesopotamian Religion (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976), pp. 77–84.
- 28. For overviews of various accounts of the patriarchal invasion, see Eller, Living in the Lap of the Goddess, pp. 150-70, and Ruether, Gaia and God, pp. 143-72. For one of the most widely read accounts, see Eisler, The Chalice and the Blade, pp. 42-58.
- 29. Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy, pp. 15-53; Ehrenberg, Women in Prehistory, pp. 99-107.
  - 30. Eisler, The Chalice and the Blade, pp. 42-58.
- 31. Hans J. Nissen, The Early History of the Ancient Near East: 9000–2000 B.C. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988), stipulates that the process of urbanization and population density leads to heightened warfare, rather than the other way around.
- 32. Robert Ellwood, "Patriarchal Revolution in Ancient Japan: Episodes from the *Nihonshoki* Sujun Chronicle," *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion* II:2 (fall 1986): pp. 23–37.

- 33. Sanday, Female Power and Male Dominance, p. 165.
- 34. Ibid., p. 8.
- 35. Barstow, "The Prehistoric Goddess," p. 14.
- 36. Exact dates are hard to give because patriarchy did not emerge all at once in all the world, or even in the Western world, nor did goddess worship decline all at once.
- 37. For several excellent surveys of this material, see Gadon, The Once and Future Goddess, and Baring and Cashford, The Myth of the Goddess.
- 38. Inanna's story is chronicled in all the standard sources already cited. For an especially fine discussion, see Diane Wolkstein and Samuel Noah Kramer, *Inanna: Queen of Heaven and Earth* (New York: Harper and Row, 1983).
- 39. Alexander Heidel, *The Babylonian Genesis* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1951), p. 42.
  - 40. Jacobsen, Treasures of Darkness, p. 179.
- 41. See Downing, The Goddess; Gadon, The Once and Future Goddess; and Baring and Cashford, The Myth of the Goddess.
- 42. This event happened at different times in different parts of Europe as Christianity slowly spread. By about 1000 c.e., this process was largely complete.
- 43. For example, see already cited works by Gadon, Baring and Cashford, and Kinsley.
- 44. For information about Lady Wisdom, see Tikva Frymer-Kensky, In the Wake of the Goddesses: Women, Culture, and the Biblical Transformation of Pagan Myth (New York: Free Press, 1992), pp. 168–83, and Joan Chamberlain Engelsman, The Feminine Dimension of the Divine (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1979). For use of Lady Wisdom in theological reconstructions of Christianity, see Johnson, She Who Is.
- 45. See the works of Gershom Scholem, especially On the Kabbalah and Its Symbolism (New York: Schocken Books, 1965).
- 46. For important discussions of whether, and to what extent, it makes sense to regard the Christian Mary as a goddess, see Kinsley, *The Goddesses' Mirror*, pp. 215–60; Gadon, *The Once and Future Goddess*, pp. 189–223; and Baring and Cashford, *The Myth of the Goddess*, pp. 547–608.

- 48. Patai, The Hebrew Goddess.
- 49. Ibid., p. 4.
- 50. The role of Asherah (wooden objects symbolizing a tree) in Israelite religious practice is a complex scholarly issue. Two highly recommended discussions are Mark S. Smith, The Early History of God: Yahweh and the Other Deities in Ancient Israel (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1990), pp. 80–114, and Frymer-Kensky, In the Wake of the Goddesses, pp. 153–61. For scholarly feminist discussions of this same material, as well as the entire problem of feminine imagery of the divine in the Hebrew Bible, see Gadon, The Once and Future Goddess, pp. 167–88, and Baring and Cashford, The Myth of the Goddess, pp. 446–85.
  - 51. Patai, The Hebrew Goddess, p. 13.
- 52. Judith Ochshorn, The Female Experience and the Nature of the Divine (Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 1981).
  - 53. Ibid., p. 13.
  - 54. Ibid., p. 15.
  - 55. Ibid., p. 242.
  - 56. Frymer-Kensky, In the Wake of the Goddesses, pp. 2-13.
  - 57. Ibid., p. 5.
  - 58. Ibid., p. 6.
  - 59. Ibid., p. 140.
  - 60. Ibid., p. 121.
  - 61. Ibid., p. 142.
  - 62. Ibid., p. 143.
  - 63. Ibid., p. 188.
  - 64. Ibid., p. 188.
  - 65. Ibid., p. 189.
- 66. Ibid., p. 198.
- 67. Ibid., p. 220.
- 68. Howard Eilberg-Schwartz, God's Phallus and Other Problems for Men and Monotheism (Boston: Beacon Press, 1994).
- 69. Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza, In Memory of Her: A Feminist Theological Reconstruction of Christian Origins (New York: Crossroad, 1984), p. xviii.

- 70. Elaine Pagels, *The Gnostic Gospels* (New York: Vintage, 1981), p. xix.
  - 71. Ibid., p. xviii.

NOTES TO PAGES 181-93

- 72. Ibid., pp. 77-78.
- 73. Ibid.
- 74. Ibid., p. 62.
- 75. Ibid., pp. 67-68.
- 76. Ibid., p. 68.
- 77. Ibid., pp. 71-72.
- 78. Ibid., p. 71.
- 79. Ibid., p. 73.
- 80. Ibid., p. 75.
- 81. Schüssler Fiorenza, In Memory of Her, p. xiii.
- 82. Ibid., p. 52.
- 83. Ibid., p. 131.
- 84. Ibid., p. 134.
- 85. Ibid., pp. 150-51.
- 86. Ibid., pp. 175-84.
- 87. Ibid., p. 198.
- 88. Ibid., pp. 198–99.
- 89. Ibid., p. 250.
- 90. Ibid., p. 236.
- 91. For example, see Gupta, "Kali the Savior," summarized in chapter four.
- 92. For a much more complete discussion of Buddhist history, see Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy, pp. 17–121.
  - 93. Ibid., p. 121.
- 94. Miranda Shaw, Passionate Enlightenment: Women in Tantric Buddhism (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994).
- 95. Janis Dean Willis, The Diamond Light: An Introduction to Tibetan Buddhist Meditations (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1972), p. 103.
- 96. For discussion of the concept of emptiness and its profeminist usages, even in traditional Buddhism, see Gross, *Buddhism after Patriar-chy*, pp. 55–77.
  - 97. For a standard textbook account, see Richard H. Robinson and

Willard L. Johnson, *The Buddhist Religion: A Historical Introduction*, 3rd ed. (Belmont, Calif.: Wadsworth, 1982), pp. 5–37.

- 98. For a full discussion of these stories, with references to the major secondary literature on the period, see Gross, *Buddhism after Patriarchy*, pp. 29–55.
  - 99. Ibid., p. 39.
  - 100. Ibid.
- 101. The most accessible version combines the two major English translations into one volume. Mrs. C. A. F. Rhys Davids and K. R. Norman, trans., *Poems of Early Buddhist Nuns* (London: Pali Text Society, 1989). See also Susan Murcott, *The First Buddhist Women: Translations and Commentary on the Therigatha* (Berkeley, Calif.: Parallax Press, 1991).
  - 102. Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy, pp. 40-54.
- 103. Tsultrim Allione, Women of Wisdom (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1984).
- 104. Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy, pp. 93–99, and Gross, "Yeshe Tsogyel: Enlightened Consort, Great Teacher, Female Role Model," in Feminine Ground: Essays on Women and Tibet, ed. Janice Dean Willis (Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion, 1987), pp. 11–32.
- 105. Daly, Beyond God the Father, pp. 74-75, and Ruether, Sexism and God-Talk, p. 122.

#### Chapter 6: What Next? Postpatriarchal Religion

- 1. An Inclusive Language Lectionary: Readings for Year A, Revised Edition (Atlanta, New York, Philadelphia: John Knox Pilgrim & Westminster Press, 1986), pp. 12–13.
- 2. The Lutheran Standard, 7 October 1983, p. 16. For the article that generated the comments, see Kris Koestner, "It's Amazing," The Lutheran Standard, 5 August 1983, pp. 8–9.
- 3. Editorial, "Report on the Re-Imagining Conference," Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion XI:1 (spring 1995): pp. 136-37.
- 4. Personal communication from the ritual committee. For the translation, see *Vetaher Libenu* (Sudbury, Mass.: Congregation Beth El of the Sudbury River Valley, 1980).
  - 5. See the bibliography of Rosemary Radford Ruether, Women-

Church: Theology and Practice of Feminist Liturgical Communities (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1985). See also Charlotte Caron, To Make and Make Again: Feminist Ritual Theology (New York: Crossroad, 1993).

- 6. Ruether, Women-Church, p. 67.
- 7. Ibid., p. 56.
- 8. Ibid., p. 69.
- 9. Ibid., p. 41.
- 10. Ibid., pp. 56-57.
- 11. Quoted in Ursula King, Women and Spirituality: Voices of Protest and Promise (New Amsterdam, N.Y.: 1989), p. 170.
  - 12. Ruether, Women-Church, p. 39.
  - 13. Ibid., pp. 61-62.
  - 14. Ibid., p. xi.
- 15. For a discussion of the movement, see Arthur Waskow, *These Holy Sparks: The Rebirth of the Jewish People* (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1983).
- 16. See Marian Henriquez Nuedel, "Innovation and Tradition in a Midwestern Jewish Congregation," in Falk and Gross, *Unspoken Worlds*.
  - 17. Ruether and Keller, In Our Own Voices, p. 122.
- 18. Penina V. Adelman, "A Drink from Miriam's Cup: The Invention of Tradition among Jewish Women," Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion X:2 (fall 1994): pp. 151–66. See also Penina V. Adelman, Miriam's Well: Rituals for Jewish Women around the Year (Fresh Meadows, N.Y.: Biblio Press, 1986).
- 19. Arlene Agus, "This Month Is for You," in *The Jewish Woman:* New Perspectives, ed. Elizabeth Koltun (New York: Schocken Books, 1976), pp. 84–93.
  - 20. Adelman, "A Drink from Miriam's Cup," p. 161.
- 21. Debra Orenstein, ed., Lifecycles: Jewish Women on Life Passages and Personal Milestones, vol. 1 (Woodstock, Vt.: Jewish Lights Publishing, 1994).
  - 22. Ibid., p. xviii.
- 23. Ibid., pp. 170–77. See also Rosemary Ruether, New Woman, New Earth: Sexist Ideologies and Human Liberation (New York: Seabury, 1975), pp. 92–105.

- 24. See Eller, Living in the Lap of the Goddess, pp. 38-61, 170-76, and Ruether, New Woman, New Earth, pp. 89-114.
- 25. See especially Zsuzsanna Budapest, The Holy Book of Women's Mysteries (Berkeley: Wingbow Press, 1989), and Starhawk, The Spiral Dance: A Rebirth of the Ancient Religion of the Great Goddess (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1979).
  - 26. Eller, Living in the Lap of the Goddess, pp. 115-29.
  - 27. Budapest, The Holy Book of Women's Mysteries, pp. 25-37.
- 28. Ibid., pp. 115-37; Starhawk, The Spiral Dance, pp. 165-84; Eller, Living in the Lap of the Goddess, 87-89.
- 29. See Budapest, The Holy Book of Women's Mysteries, pp. 115-33, for examples.
  - 30. Eller, Living in the Lap of the Goddess, p. 97.
  - 31. Ibid., p. 99.
- 32. See Karma Lekshe Tsomo, ed., Sakyadhita: Daughters of the Buddha (Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion, 1988) for an example of that point of view as well as an excellent overview of Buddhist nuns.
- 33. See Gross, *Buddhism after Patriarchy*, pp. 215–21, for a full explanation of the term.
- 34. Rita M. Gross, "Buddhist Resources for Issues of Population, Consumption, and the Environment," in *Population, Consumption, and the Environment: Religious and Secular Responses*, ed. Harold Coward (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1994), pp. 155–73.
  - 35. Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy, pp. 226-40.
- 36. Ruether, Gaia and God; Sallie McFague, The Body of God: An Ecological Theology (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993).
  - 37. Ibid., pp. vii-viii.
  - 38. Ibid., p. x.
  - 39. Ibid., p. 16.
  - 40. Ibid., pp. 56-57.
  - 41. Ibid., pp. 105-9.
  - 42. Ibid., p. 14.
  - 43. Ibid., p. 131.
  - 44. Ibid., p. 132.
  - 45. Ibid., p. 149.

- 46. Ibid., p. 144.
- 47. Ibid., p. 182.
- 48. Ruether, Gaia and God, pp. 254-55.
- 49. Ibid., p. 251.
- 50. Ibid., p. 266.
- 51. Daly, Beyond God the Father, p. 28.
- 52. Ibid., pp. 33-34.
- 53. Daly, Gyn/Ecology, p. xi.
- 54. Ibid., p. xii.
- 55. Ibid., p. 39.
- 56. Ibid., pp. 59-60.
- 57. Ibid., p. 79.
- 58. Ibid., p. 355.
- 59. Ibid., pp. 28-29.
- 60. Ibid., pp. 10-11.
- 61. Ibid., p. 105.
- 62. Christ, Laughter of Aphrodite, pp. 117-32.
- 63. Ibid., p. 118.
- 64. Ibid., p. 121.
- 65. Ibid., p. 123.
- 66. Ibid., pp. 126-31.
- 67. For example, see Ruether, Gaia and God, pp. 149-55.
- 68. Starhawk, The Spiral Dance, pp. 77-78.
- 69. Ibid., p. 80.
- 70. Ibid., p. 81.
- 71. Ibid., p. 84. See also Eller, Living in the Lap of the Goddess, pp. 130-49, for an overview of the theology of the feminist spirituality movement.
  - 72. The phrase is Eller's.
  - 73. Eller, Living in the Lap of the Goddess, pp. 67-82.
  - 74. Christ, Laughter of Aphrodite, p. 154.
- 75. Monique Wittig, Les Guérillères, trans. David Le Vay (Boston: Beacon Press, 1969), p. 89.
  - 76. Ibid.
  - 77. Ibid., p. 70.

- 78. Starhawk, The Spiral Dance, p. 101.
- 79. Ibid., p. 94.
- 80. Budapest, The Holy Book of Women's Mysteries, pp. 161-62.
- 81. Christ, Laughter of Aphrodite, p. 71.
- 82. Eller, Living in the Lap of the Goddess, pp. 74-81. See also Andy Smith, "For All Those Who Were Indian in a Former Life," Ms. November-December 1991, pp. 44-45.
- (83.) Christine Downing, The Goddess: Mythological Images of the Feminine (1981), Journey through Menopause: A Personal Rite of Passage (1987), Psyche's Sisters: Reimagining the Meaning of Sisterhood (1990), Myths and Mysteries of Same-Sex Love (1991), Women's Mysteries: Toward a Poetics of Gender (1992), and Gods in Our Midst: Mythological Images of the Masculine, a Woman's View (1993). All are published by Crossroad Continuum of New York.
- 84. I first presented this paper and slide show at the same American Academy of Religion meeting at which Carol P. Christ first presented her paper "Why Women Need the Goddess." Carol and I had deliberately avoided talking with each other as we prepared our papers because we didn't want to influence each other. We were shocked at the similarity of our insights and suggestions. "Hindu Female Deities as a Resource for the Contemporary Rediscovery of the Goddess" was first published in *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* XLVI:3 (1978): 269–92. More popular versions are published as "Hindu Female Deities as a Resource for the Contemporary Rediscovery of the Goddess," in *The Book of the Goddess: Past and Present*, ed. Carl Olsen (New York: Crossroad, 1983) and "Steps toward Feminine Imagery of Deity in Jewish Theology," in Heschel, *On Being a Jewish Feminist*.
  - 85. Gross, "Some Buddhist Perspectives on the Goddess."
  - 86. Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy, p. 252.
  - 87. Ibid., p. 288.
  - 88. For fuller discussion, see Gross, "Helping the Iron Bird Fly."
  - 89. Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy, pp. 146-51.
- 90. Gross, "Suffering, Feminist Theory, and Images of Goddess," Anima: An Experiential Journal XIII: 1 (fall 1986): pp. 39-46.
  - 91. Gross, Buddhism after Patriarchy, pp. 280-88.

- 92. Ruether, Gaia and God, p. 141.
- 93. Ibid., pp. 139-40.
- 94. Christ, Laughter of Aphrodite, p. 217.
- 95. Ibid., pp. 226-27.
- 96. Naomi Goldenberg, Returning Words to Flesh: Feminism, Psychoanalysis, and the Resurrection of the Body (Boston: Beacon Press, 1990).
- 97. Charlene Spretnak, introduction to The Politics of Women's Spirituality: Essays on the Rise of Spiritual Power within the Feminist Movement (New York: Anchor Books, 1982), p. xiii.
  - 98. Ibid., pp. 571-73.
- 99. Catherine Keller, From a Broken Web: Separation, Sexism, and Self (Boston: Beacon Press, 1986), pp. 2-3.
- 100. Mary Hunt, Fierce Tenderness: A Feminist Theology of Friendship (New York: Crossroad, 1991), pp. 2-10.
- 101. Judith Plaskow, "Transforming the Nature of Community," in Cooey, Eakin, and McDaniel, *After Patriarchy*, p. 97.
  - 102. Ibid., pp. 102-3.
- 103. For more detail, see Gross, *Buddhism after Patriarchy*, pp. 258–69.
- 104. Rosemary Radford Ruether, Womanguides: Readings toward a Feminist Theology (Boston: Beacon Press, 1985).
- 105. William E. Paden, Religious Worlds: The Comparative Study of Religion (Boston: Beacon Press, 1988), p. 164. This book is highly recommended as an overview of the merits of the comparative study of religion.
  - 106. Ibid., p. 38.