Holy Movement and Holy Place: Christian Pilgrimage and the *Hajj*

By Robin M. Taylor

Abstract: This article uses a comparative theological model to explore the concept of pilgrimage—holy movement and holy place. It examines Christian pilgrimage exemplified by John Paul II's pilgrimage to Jerusalem in 2000 and Islamic pilgrimage exemplified by the *Hajj*. It then re-visions Christian pilgrimage by suggesting how three features of the Hajj (danger and hardship, ritual nature, and gathering) can be used to deepen the Christian experience and understanding of pilgrimage.

Key Terms: pilgrimage, Hajj, Pope John Paul II, holy place, comparative theology

Religious Pilgrimage

Holy movement and holy place are two concepts that religious traditions express in characteristic practices. Religious pilgrimage is one of those practices that, at its most fundamental level, is the holy movement of the faithful to the holy places of the faith. Pilgrimage intertwines the concepts of holy place and holy movement to inform the faithful of "where they are" and "where they are going" within the sacred traditions of the religion.

Pilgrimage is a cross-religious phenomenon and, as such, provides us with an opportunity to explore the practice within different religious traditions. Exploring the practices of other religious traditions can serve as a springboard for an enhanced understanding of the characteristic expressions of our own religious tradition. In a world of religious pluralism, we have the opportunity to sally forth from a comfortable place within our own tradition, to engage seriously with another religion, and then to return to and inform our tradition with the insights of the other. In this article, I start from the perspective of the Christian pilgrimage, exemplified in the pilgrimage of Pope John Paul II to Jerusalem in 2000, then engage with the Islamic pilgrimage tradition of the *Hajj*, and finally engage in a new consideration of our own Christian pilgrimage tradition.

Comparative Theology and Superabundance of Meaning

The method of comparative theology provides a means of interacting with religious pluralism in a constructive manner that honors the contributions of different faith traditions.[1] In Paul Knitter's striking image, "the other religions are not just new 'data' to be placed under the Christian microscope; they are also materials with which we can build new microscopes."[2]

The comparative theological model assumes the practice or belief under examination is not truly incommensurable (although a conclusion of incommensurability may in itself be useful). There is often in play a notion of "superabundance of meaning" in which the foundations of any religious tradition are too much or extend beyond that which

Robin M. Taylor is a candidate for the master of arts in religion degree at the Lutheran Theological Seminary at Gettysburg, an Adjunct Professor at the George Mason University School of Law, and a practicing attorney.

is required to support the tradition.[3] Comparative theology's commitment is that it can work in these "spilling over" spaces.

The Islamic *Hajj* is one of those practices with an abundance of meaning operating within the Islamic tradition, per se, and also within its earlier antecedents of pagan and Israelite/Jewish pilgrimage traditions. The unique aspects of the Hajj help to illuminate not only these earlier traditions, but also to provide a new way of looking at modern Christian pilgrimages to the Christian holy city of Jerusalem. An exploration of the Hajj can help us to build a new and enhanced model of Christian pilgrimage. Before turning to the Hajj, however, I first discuss Christian pilgrimage as exemplified by John Paul II's pilgrimage to Jerusalem.

John Paul II's Jerusalem Pilgrimage—God Made Closer

Throughout his pontificate, John Paul II expressed a desire to go on pilgrimage, especially to the holy sites of Jerusalem.[4] As a Christian, John Paul II's identification with Jerusalem was grounded in the Christian approach to salvation: that the life, death, and resurrection of Jesus Christ are constitutive of salvation and that Jesus Christ is the paradigm for human salvation. The Christian tradition is broad enough to embrace many different ways in which the cross of Jesus is understood and many different ways in which salvation is realized through Jesus. But all of these different understandings of salvation share a common connection to Jesus and his life, death, and resurrection.[5]

Physical Connection

John Paul II used pilgrimage to the places where Jesus lived as a personal means of experiencing this connection with Jesus. He used travel to these places as a means of access to Jesus—making the access real through its concreteness. He felt that he could connect with Jesus through the physical act of retracing Jesus' steps.[6] As he explained it, the "physical particularity of the land" is "inseparable from the truth of the human flesh" of Jesus.[7]

Holy Space as Sacrament of Geography

Underneath this personal desire to realize physically a closer connection with Jesus was a deeper theological understanding of the concept of holy space. As John Paul II noted in his 1999 Letter Concerning Pilgrimage to the Places Linked to the History of Salvation, sacred space is "where the encounter with the divine may be experienced more intensely than it would normally be in the vastness of the cosmos."[8] In order words, space bears "the stamp of particular saving actions of God."[9]

This theological understanding of space as a "sacrament of geography" is common in many religions. Kenneth Cragg notes that this is "access [to the divine] by contact," based on the attachment of memories to a specific holy place.[10] So although Christianity emerged from its Jewish roots in a deterritorialized form, John Paul II's concept of pilgrimage harks back to religion's earlier folklorist roots.

Personal Experience and Personal Journey

It is important to note that John Paul II's understanding of his Jerusalem pilgrimage was akin to a spiritual exercise in which his relationship with Jesus might be deepened through the possibility of closer union with God. He was not claiming that the pilgrimage was undertaken in imitation of Jesus or his disciples. Nor was he claiming that the pilgrimage would contribute to his self-identity as a Christian. Although all of these are valid understandings of Christian pilgrimage,[11] John Paul II's emphasis was squarely on a personal experience of contact with Jesus through experiencing the physical location of Jesus' life and death.

Moreover, he thought of this personal experience as part of a pilgrim's own personal journey of trust and hope in Jesus as the Redeemer. He stated that it "evokes the believer's personal journey in the footsteps of the Redeemer. It is an exercise of practical asceticism, of repentance for human weakness, of constant vigilance over one's own frailty, of interior preparation for a change of heart."[12]

The journey metaphor was important for John Paul II, as it made God real in both time and space. God "does not look down on us from on high," but "became our travelling companion," and "has gone before us and leads us on."[13]

The Holy City of Jerusalem

Although John Paul II wished to go to other places as well, the focus of his pilgrimage was the paradigmatic holy place of Jerusalem. For Christians, Jerusalem is a "living sign" of the redemption that Christ accomplished for all people in that same Holy City.[14] Jerusalem is that "special land" [in which] "our reconciliation with God was brought about."[15] And Jerusalem is one of those places in which "God chose to pitch [God's] tent among us."[16]

It is because of the holy city of Jerusalem that John Paul II's pilgrimage brought to the forefront another aspect of his Jerusalem pilgrimage: reconciliation. The pilgrimage would also "honour the deep bond which Christians continue to have with the Jewish people from whom Christ came according to the flesh, . . . and to [help] remove once and for all the misunderstandings which . . . have so often through the centuries marked with bitterness the relationship between Christians and Jews."[17] John Paul II also hoped that the pilgrimage would provide an opportunity to meet with the "followers of Islam . . . so that, without compromising clarity of witness, there may be a strengthening of the grounds for mutual understanding and esteem."[18] This pope, as so often was the case in his travels, would make his pilgrimage to Jerusalem as an emissary of peace and reconciliation.[19]

The Hajj

In Islam, pilgrimage is an essential practice. For Muslims, the origins of the Hajj and the holy places of Mecca lie deep in the primeval past. According to the Qur'an, Abraham and his son Ishmael laid the foundations of the Ka'ba in Mecca, offering the structure to Allah: "when Abraham was raising the plinth of the House with Ishmael, (he prayed): 'Accept this from us, O Lord'" (Qur'an, 2:127).[20] Later Islamic tradition claimed that Adam had already hallowed the site.[21] But the cult dedicated to the worship of Allah degenerated, and the Meccans "exchanged the religion of Abraham and Ishmael for another."[22]

As the host city of the Ka'ba, Mecca had been a pagan pilgrimage site since antiquity, and was likely in use as such for millennia before Muhammad. There is little doubt that pre-Islamic Arabs had a cult of stones at the site of the Ka'ba.[23] The Qur'an takes note of this, even mentioning that the months for pilgrimage were matters of common knowledge (Qur'an, 2:197).

The pre-Islamic pilgrimage was composed of a series of rituals. Muhammad took those traditions and reoriented them away from the worship of idols toward the worship of Allah. In effect, "the later Muslim tradition 'harmonized' the Islamic version of the complex by identifying each of its elements with some incident in the Abraham legend, which was itself enriched by association with otherwise inexplicable practices in the Hajj ritual."[24]

The Duty of the Hajj

The Hajj is one of the five pillars of Islam, commanded in the Qur'an as a duty for the faithful to perform. In Sura 22, "The Pilgrimage," the Qur'an sets forth the commandment:

> 27. Announce the Pilgrimage to the people. They will come to you on foot and riding along distant roads on lean and slender beasts,
> 28. In order to reach the place of advantage

> for them,
> and to pronounce the name of God on appointed days over cattle He has given them for food;
> then eat of the meat and feed the needy and the poor.
> 29. Let them then attend to their persons and complete the rites of pilgrimage, fulfill their vows and circuit round the ancient House.
> 30. Apart from this, whoever respects the sacred ordinances of God,
> will find a better reward for him with his Lord. (Qur'an, 22:27–30)

The Qur'an commands every Muslim who can afford it to "visit the House on a pilgrimage as duty to God" (Qur'an, 3:97).[25]

The Basics[26]

The Hajj (in common parlance) includes two main components of rituals: the 'Umrah and the Hajj itself.[27] Before beginning the journey it is vital for the pilgrim to have the correct intention. The Hajj requires a true and sincere intention of undertaking the journey and the rituals as an offering only to Allah. Ali Shariati sees it as the resolve to "[dig] 'you' out from the 'self' . . . a migration from the house of 'self' to the House of God."[28]

Moreover, the pilgrim is encouraged to make arrangements to provide for his or her family and to pay all debts, redress all wrongs, and to write a will. Women must be accompanied by a *mahram* (a male within the relationship of unmarriageable kin).[29] If the woman does not have a *mahram*, she is exempt from the requirement of the Hajj (and would not receive a visa from the Saudi government in any case).[30]

Preparations are extensive. Given the sheer size of the number of pilgrims who visit the Hizrah during the Hajj (more than 2.1 million in 2006),[31] the pilgrim must make detailed travel arrangements. Most pilgrims travel in tightly controlled groups, and all must arrive by the appointed time, ten weeks after the end of Ramadan.

The Hajj begins with the pilgrim entering into a ritual state of purity known as *ihram*. A pilgrim must be in this state before entering the Miqat, which are stated locations in which pilgrims enter the Hejaz. The pilgrim must wash, clip nails and hair (the requirements differ for men and women), and put on *ihram* clothing. For men this is two white seamless garments and sandals. Women may dress in any appropriate modest dress. Only men remove their underwear. During the *ihram* period, the pilgrim may not kill an animal or have sexual intercourse. The pilgrim then recites his intention for the type of pilgrimage that he intends to make. (Women do not recite the intention, but say it silently to themselves.)

After ablutions, pilgrims go directly to the mosque Al-Masjid Al-Haraam and perform Tawaf. This involves circling the Ka'ba seven times in a counter-clockwise direction. For men, the first three rotations are performed at a quick pace. The pilgrim recites prayers during the rotations and says Allahu Akbar each time he or she comes around to the black stone. Thus, the ritual is not a mere physical ritual. The pilgrim is an active participant in praying to Allah and praising Allah's name.[32] The physical rite becomes the opportunity for redirection of the pilgrim to the contemplation of his or her relationship with Allah. Moreover, it is an outpouring of gratitude and memory for Abraham and Ishmael who returned the stone to its rightful place as an object dedicated to the worship of Allah.[33]

The pilgrim next goes to the Sa'ee area, east of the Ka'ba. The pilgrim walks between two hills (Safa and Marwah), making seven rounds in all. Men walk quickly between two green columns, and menstruating women are not allowed to perform Sa'ee at all. The Sa'ee is, however, more than just a walking ritual. It is an explicit re-creation of the memory of Hagar in distress, without water and seemingly abandoned by all, even Allah. It recreates Hagar running in search of water for a weak and dying Ishmael. The faithful believe that Allah revealed the spring to her, and through its life-giving waters, Ishmael was revived.[34] The pilgrim then drinks the water of the Zamzam well, believed to be the spring Allah disclosed to Hagar. This completes the 'Umrah.

The next stage of the pilgrimage is the Hajj proper. The pilgrim travels to Mina on the eighth

day of Dhul-Hijah (the final month of the Islamic calendar) anytime before noon. On the next day, the pilgrim undertakes the trek to Arafat. The pilgrim must reach Arafat on that day or the pilgrim's Hajj will be void. Arafat is the location of the Mount of Rahmah, the mount of mercy.

At sunset, the pilgrim moves on to Muzdalifah where the pilgrim spends the night. After sunrise, the pilgrim travels back to Mina and goes to the Jamrat al-Aqabah. There the pilgrim throws seven pebbles at a pillar from the Jamarat bridge ("Stoning the Devil") on the great feast day of Eid-Ul-Adha. Traditionally, Muslims believe that the pebble-throwing ritual takes place at the location where Satan tempted Abraham on his way to sacrifice his son Ishmael. Allah has commanded Muslims to throw pebbles at these locations as a symbol of fighting the temptations of Satan.

The pilgrim then performs the necessary Eid sacrifice by having ritual sacrificers slaughter a sheep. (Other animals are possible, but it seems to be most customary to slaughter a sheep.)

The pilgrim must also have his head shaved if a man, or hair cut about one inch if a woman.[35] The pilgrim then performs Tawaf and Sa'ee at Mecca and once again goes to Mina. The pilgrim then throws the pebbles three more times, each time throwing seven pebbles, this time at all three pillars located at the Jamrat al-Aqabah.

The pilgrim finishes the Hajj by returning to Mecca and performing a final farewell Tawaf. The pilgrim then departs for home (although many pilgrims spend additional time touring Medina).

The Experience Itself

The Hajj itself is overwhelming.[36] It is overwhelming in terms of the number of pilgrims and in the sheer physical effort required to perform it. Although the exact timing of the Hajj varies from year to year due to the lunar calendar, temperatures in Saudi Arabia are routinely in the upper 90s and low 100s. Dehydration and heat-related illnesses are common occurrences, especially for those pilgrims not acclimated to the heat. And given that many pilgrims are older and infirm, the Hajj is a battleground for survival. Fortunately, the days of smallpox and cholera appear to be over.[37] However, many pilgrims take their own stock of antibiotics and analgesics to enable the members of their party to complete the Hajj.

Yet danger is not limited to the bodily demands of the exercise; it also comes from other directions. Pilgrims have been trampeled in stampedes, usually in the Stoning of the Devil ritual,[38] fires occur, and terrorist attacks and riots are not unknown.[39]

The Hajj, however, also is a deeply personal experience. Unlike the other pillars of Islam, it has no ethical basis—no rules for how to orient and conduct one's self in living with other men and women. But pilgrims describe it as a deeply satisfying spiritual experience. Despite extremely public processions, the pilgrim is still able to enter a state of fulfillment of his or her religious life.[40] For many, this is expressed as a vital piece of a spiritual voyage of discovery.[41]

The Hajj also has an explicit salvific aspect. Quite simply, the pilgrim who completes the Hajj (the Hajji) is forgiven her sins. And, reminiscent of the motivations for delaying baptism in early Christians, many Muslims who complete the Hajj are acutely aware of their new status. They know they have been cleansed, but only in a retrospective manner, and now, going forward, sins count as against a clean slate. Michael Wolfe quotes a fellow Hajji as saying,

> Do you know why the hadj is so hard? . . . Because you're working off your sins. At the end of it, if you've done things right, you should come out as clean as a baby . . . And it makes me nervous. Because everything I do from here on really matters. It's a dangerous position.[42]

All of this contributes to a sense of anxiety during the Hajj: no less than salvation is at stake, and that salvation is dependent upon the correct performance of the rituals. Mistakes vitiate the salvific effect of the pilgrimage, even if the intent is correct. The rituals themselves are very complicated and many require interpretation. Thus, most pilgrims use guides (some with more

knowledge than others) to help them through the process.

The Hajj also has a communal focus. Time and again, accounts of the Hajj focus on its gathering aspect: that Muslims from around the world congregate in Mecca to perform together the same rituals. This provides an opportunity to engage with fellow Muslims and to see the faith as encompassing one brotherhood and sisterhood of all believers. Similar clothes, similar rituals, similar intentions, all tend to join the pilgrims into a unified body of believers. This is, of course, what struck Malcolm X, that Muslims were truly all the same.[43]

The Importance of the Hajj for Christian Pilgrimage

From Islam, we now return to the Christian tradition of pilgrimage. The question is how the Hajj helps us to re-vision the Christian pilgrimage to Jerusalem as seen through the eyes of a pilgrim such as Pope John Paul II.[44]

First, we should note that John Paul II's understanding of pilgrimage and the Hajj are similar in many respects. Each tradition fits along a continuum, with one having a bit more emphasis here and the other a bit more emphasis there. For example, both may be described in terms of a spiritual exercise in which travel to and certain actions in a sacred place have the potential to bring the pilgrim closer to God. Both clearly make use of a theology of space in which the location of the actions is important to achieving a transformative effect. Both traditions are productive for members of their own faith communities to more fully experience God.

In addition, there are elements in the Hajj pilgrimage that shed light on John Paul II's understanding in a way that makes his concept of pilgrimage more vivid and pointed. In particular, there are three aspects of the Hajj that I believe offer additional insight into a Christian pilgrimage theology.

Danger and Hardship

The Hajj is, to put it bluntly, a more dangerous, more risky enterprise. I do not mean that the average Muslim pilgrim will lose her life in the Hajj; nor do I mean that traveling to Jerusalem as a Christian is free from all danger. But, all in all, journeying along the pathway of the Hajj is a more difficult proposition. It is more difficult because of the external dangers in and of themselves, and also because of the pilgrim's internal responses to these dangers. Completing the Hajj presupposes a certain level of fitness and a certain level of luck in avoiding the dangers. For too many Christians, a trip to Jerusalem loses this quality of risk and becomes a mere tourist visit.

Danger and hardship remind Christians of what is at stake in their commitment to God. The Hajj serves as a reminder that travelling along a religious pathway in life is a difficult process, with an uncertain outcome that is not entirely within one's control.

Christians must, in a sense, be "at their best" in making the pilgrim journey in the life of Christ. And perhaps this is where Christian pilgrimage should be a bit more Hajj-like. If a pilgrimage to Jerusalem is a spiritual exercise (as in John Paul II's view), then maybe the pilgrim should view it as more of a spiritual (and physical) *challenge*, certainly not just an escape from everyday life.

This is not to suggest that Christian pilgrimage should be an experience of suffering for the sake of suffering, especially in the sense of some type of imitative experience of the suffering of Jesus. Rather, "hardship" or "austerity" may be more apposite terms for the suggestion I am making. To experience the journey with all of the comforts of our modern technology, divorced from the physicality of the land and our bodies, is to short-change the pilgrimage experience. The *exercise* of the journey requires engagement with it as a physical journey, so it should inspire and require ideational *and* physical ardor.

To walk in the steps of Jesus should literally mean walking along the hot and dusty paths, experiencing the heat and dust of the Judean

countryside. Being a Christian is risky—perhaps Christian pilgrimage should be a bit more physically risky too.

The Ritual—What We Do Matters

What is done during the Hajj and how it is done matters. Flawed actions vitiate good intentions. The Hajj is about paying attention to the rules and performing actions correctly, whether the Hajj pilgrim fully understands the meaning of those rules or not.

In other words, actions do matter. It is all too easy to practice a form of Christianity that is full of grace and short on proper action. The Hajj helps us to see that the manner in which a Christian pilgrim conducts her life is important, whether as a pilgrim or as a believer after the pilgrimage experience. Living as a Christian is not simply an interior journey of the soul. To be an authentic Christian requires a physical engagement with the world, adhering to requirements that the Christian community deems to be authentic marks of a Christian. Not all behaviors or methods of acting are acceptable.

The Hajj also tells us that sometimes the ritual, in and of itself, is important in its own right. Even if a person cannot fully articulate the reasons surrounding a ritual in any rational way, the effect of performing the ritual transcends a rational explanation. Rituals are, by their very nature, attempts at ascertaining a deeper reality than other forms of cognitive understanding generate. The Hajj rituals are one example of how performance, for the sake of performance, can lead a pilgrim toward a more unifying experience with God.

Although the activities undertaken on Christian pilgrimages are often of a ritualistic nature, John Paul II's pilgrimage lacked the nature of being a ritual in and of itself. In other words, the pilgrimage per se was not a ritual, constituted by clearly delineated activities to be performed in a certain order and in a certain manner. John Paul II's activities during his pilgrimage were largely a matter of his own design.

Perhaps it would be helpful to refocus our understanding of the Christian pilgrimage as a ritual, giving pilgrimage all of the respect that is given to the other rituals of the Christian church. This would take us one step closer to understanding the pilgrimage as a sacrament—indeed as a sacrament of geography. A revised Christian theology of pilgrimage, then, would situate pilgrimage within a broader sacramental view of life. Instead of fleeing from the materiality of human beings and the created world, this sacramental view of pilgrimage would embrace it.

The Gathered Community

Perhaps the most distinctive element of the Hajj is its gathering element, as Muslims from around the world assemble in Mecca to not only individually but also communally perform the rituals of the Hajj. This brotherhood and sisterhood of all Muslim believers embarking on pilgrimage is quite different from the pilgrimage of John Paul II and the pilgrimages of most Christians.

Although John Paul II urged other Christians to make a pilgrimage to Jerusalem in the Jubilee Year of 2000 (and he certainly traveled with others), his pilgrimage was basically undertaken in isolation. There was no coordinated gathering of Christians from around the world in any representative sense. Millions did not descend upon Jerusalem to participate in identical rituals, nor to explore their identity together as Christian brothers and sisters.

But this is the great gift of the Hajj. And if the church is truly the community of all believers, then there is no better physical expression of this unity than joint gatherings of Christians from all over the world in all of their diversity. Although there are world assemblies and the like, Christianity has not developed a truly representative gathering experience to express the unity of the church.

As the Christian church continues to fragment, what better way to come together than on pilgrimage to the holy city of Jerusalem? Perhaps pilgrimage, following in the tradition of the early Christians, is one concrete response to fragmentation inherent in our post-modern world.

Implications for Interreligious Dialogue

These explorations have brought us full circle from a Christian concept of pilgrimage (expressed as John Paul II's 2000 pilgrimage to Mecca), to the Islamic pilgrimage of the Hajj, and then finally to a re-visioning of the Christian pilgrimage tradition. Although we have returned to our Christian home, we have returned reinvigorated with a new grasp on our traditions by encounter with the traditions of the other. The Hajj provides useful points of contact with Christian pilgrimage and points us in the direction of a new and more vivid understanding of the potentials of Christian pilgrimage.

These types of comparative theological explorations also remind us of the possibilities for continued interreligious dialogue. Pilgrimage as an intertwining of holy movement and holy place reminds us of the importance of geographical space to both Christianity and Islam. By reflecting on Christian pilgrimage traditions in light of other traditions, such as the Hajj, Christians may be able to better understand and appreciate the foundations and implications of Christian notions of holy movement and holy place. And by reflecting on Islamic pilgrimage traditions in light of the other, Muslims also may be able to better understand and appreciate the foundations and implications of their notions of holy movement and holy place. Movement and place as expressed in pilgrimage open new ways of seeing and understanding one another.

Endnotes

1. See Reid B. Locklin and Hugh Nicholson, "The Return of Comparative Theology," *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 78, no. 2 (June 2010): 490, for a discussion of comparative theology as a discipline for a post-modern world.

2. Paul F. Knitter, *Introducting Theologies of Religions* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 2002), 205.

3. See Peter Ochs, "Philosophic Warrants for Scriptural Reasoning," *Modern Theology* 22, no. 3 (July 2006): 465–482.

4. Drew Christiansen, "Place of Divine Encounter: The Holy See's Hopes for Jerusalem," *America*, August 13–20, 2007, 19.

5. David A. Brondos, *Fortress Introduction to Salvation and the Cross* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2007), 1.

6. Andrew Walsh, "Two Cheers for the Pilgrimage," *Religion in the News*, Summer 2000, 4.

7. John Paul II, *Letter Concerning Pilgrimage to the Places Linked to the History of Salvation,* June 30, 1999, section 3. Available in English translation at: http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/john_paul_ii/letters/documents/hf_jp-ii_let_30061999_pilgrimage_en.html (accessed February 7, 2011).

8. Ibid., sect. 2.

9. Ibid.

10. Kenneth Cragg, "Jesus, Jerusalem and Pilgrimage Today," in *Explorations in a Christian Theology of Pilgrimage*, ed. Craig Bartholomew and Fred Hughes (Burlington, Vt.: Ashgate Publishing Company, 2004), 1–2.

11. See J. G. Davies, *Pilgrimage Yesterday and Today: Why? Where? How?* (London: SCM Press Ltd., 1988), chap. 4.

12. Hunt Janin, *Four Paths to Jerusalem: Jewish, Christian, Muslim, and Secular Pilgrimages, 1000 BCE to 2001 CE* (Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland & Company, 2002), 198.

13. John Paul II, *Letter Concerning Pilgrimage*, sect. 10.

14. John Paul II, "Apostolic Letter Redemptionis Anno [On Jerusalem and the Middle East]," April 20, 1984. Available in English translation at http://www.ccjr.us/dialogika-resources/documents-and-statements/roman-catholic/pope-john-paul-ii/301-jp2–84apr20 (accessed February 7, 2011).

15. Ibid.

16. John Paul II, *Letter Concerning Pilgrimage*, sect. 11.

17. Ibid., sect. 10.

18. Ibid.

19. Editorial, "Pilgrimage for Reconciliation," *America*, April 10, 1999, 3.

20. Quotations from the Qur'an are from Ahmed Ali, *Al-Qur'an: A Contemporary Translation,* rev. ed., 9th paperback printing (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1993).

21. F. E. Peters, *The Hajj: The Muslim Pilgrimage to Mecca and the Holy Places* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1994), 7.

22. Ibn al-Kalbi, quoted in Peters, *Hajj*, 21.

23. Peters, *Hajj,* 21.

24. Ibid., 31.

25. There are exceptions, such as for age and infirmity. See Abu Muneer Ismail Davids, *Getting the Best Out of the Al-Hajj (Pilgrimage)* (Riyadh: Maktaba Darussalm, 2006), 265. It is also possible for someone to act as a proxy for another and perform the Hajj on her behalf, an act known as Hajj-e-badal. See Michael Wolfe, *The Hadj* (New York: Grove Press, 1993), 214.

26. Unless otherwise stated, the detailed description of the rituals is taken primarily from Mamdouh N. Mohamed, *Hajj & 'Umrah: The Islamic Pilgrimage from A to Z,* 5th ed. (Falls Church, Va.: B 200 Inc., 2008).

27. If the Hajj and the 'Umrah are performed consecutively, the pilgrim is performing Qiran. If they are not done consecutively (yet still within the same year), the pilgrim is performing Tamattu'. If only the Hajj (proper) is performed, the pilgrim is performing Ifrad. For purposes of this article, I assume a

consecutive Qiran type of performance. Mohamed, *Hajj & 'Umrah*, 90–91.

28. Ali Shariati, *Hajj: Reflections on its Rituals*, trans. Laleh Bakhtiar (Albuquerque, N.M.: Abjad, 1992), 51–52.

29. Mohamed, *Hajj & 'Umrah*, 28.

30. There is an exception for a woman over the age of 45 if she is traveling with an organized group. However, she must "submit a no objection letter from her husband, son or brother authorizing her to travel . . . with the named group." See http://www.saudiembassy.net/services/umrah_visas.aspx (accessed February 7, 2011).

31. See the Saudi Ministry of the Hajj's website at http://www.hajinformation.com/main/l.htm (accessed February 7, 2011).

32. Muhammad Zafrulla Khan, *Islam: Its Meaning for Modern Man* (New York: Harper & Row, 1962), 119.

33. Ibid., 121.

34. Ibid., 118.

35. There does seem to be variation in this practice. Wolfe reports only a ritual snipping for men. Wolfe, *The Hadj*, 168.

36. See generally Wolfe's account in *The Hadj*.

37. Saida Miller Khalifa, "From the Fifth Pillar," in *One Thousand Roads to Mecca*, ed. Michael Wolfe (New York: Grove Press, 1997), 519.

38. For a listing of recent stampede tragedies related to the Hajj, see Owen Boycott, "244 Pilgrims Killed in Stampede During Devil Stoning Ritual," *The Guardian* (Manchester, UK), February 2, 2004, http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2004/feb/02/saudiarabia.owenbowcott (accessed February 7, 2011).

39. "Middle East: Sacrilege in Mecca," *Time*, December 3, 1979.

40. Wolfe, *The Hadj*, 266.

41. Khalifa, "Fifth Pillar," 522.

42. Wolfe, *The Hadj*, 280.

43. Malcolm X, "From the Autobiography of Malcolm X," in *One Thousand Roads to Mecca*, ed. Wolfe, 501.

44. There are aspects of the Hajj that are problematic for many contemporary Christians, such as animal sacrifice and the differing ritualistic rules for men and women. I do not mean to suggest in this article that all aspects of the Hajj are fruitful for further reflection on the concept of Christian pilgrimage. However, the three aspects highlighted in this article do seem to be useful for constructing a deeper understanding of Christian pilgrimage.