PUBLISHED FOR

JUDAICA RESEARCH AT YALE UNIVERSITY

LOUIS M. RABINOWITZ FOUNDATION

on the

SAADIA GAON THE BOOK OF BELIEFS AND OPINIONS

TRANSLATED FROM THE ARABIC AND THE HEBREW BY SAMUEL ROSENBLATT

THE JOHNS HOPKINS UNIVERSITY

YALE UNIVERSITY PRESS NEW HAVEN AND LONDON .

jan -

INTRODUCTION

Saadia Ben Joseph

SAADIA BEN JOSEPH, the greatest of the Geonim, as the heads of the celebrated Babylonian Talmudical academies of Sura and Pumbeditha during the post-Saburaic period were called, was born in the Fayyum district of Upper Egypt. Next to nothing is now known can be stated with certainty is that the Egypt in which the future midway, as it did, between the two cultural centers of Babylonia age of twenty-three he already had to his credit the composition of of the Karaite sect, Anan.

From the time of his departure from Egypt until the fall of 921 C.E. the young scholar moved between Palestine, Aleppo, and Bagdad, separated from his wife and children and his pupils. The outbreak in the autumn of the latter year of a violent controversy over the right to fix the calendar, upon which depended the dates of the holidays, gave Saadia an opportunity to display both his Babylonians, he succeeded in completely refuting the cause of the of the Palestinian leader Ben Meir. In recognition of his services title of Alluf.

The next time Saadia is heard from is in the year 928, when he was appointed to the Gaonate of Sura, being the first foreigner to be invited to occupy this most important and influential position of leadership in the Judaism of his day. He had been in office only two years when a fierce quarrel ensued between him and the man who had been chiefly responsible for his elevation, the Exilarch

especially since his colleague, the Gaon of Pumbeditha, had unconsidered the decree illegal. This action on the part of Saadia, pute, to which Saadia refused to give his endorsement because he from the royal house of David. The cause of the conflict was a mous Jewish community of Babylonia, who traced his descent David ben Zakkai, the hereditary secular head of the semi-autonodecision rendered by the Exilarch concerning an inheritance disnaming one of his own choice instead. pronounced a ban on Saadia and appointed another Gaon in his hesitantly affixed his signature, so enraged the Exilarch that he place. Saadia retaliated by outlawing the existing Exilarch and

tioning side by side until, owing to a change of government, David devoted by Saadia to intensive literary activity. Then, through the ben Zakkai contrived to have Saadia officially removed from the the Exilarch and the Gaon. However, the period of renewed friendmediation of mutual friends, a reconciliation was effected between Gaonate. The five years during which he lived in retirement were ship was not destined to last very long, for three years later David tige, himself passed away. ship of the academy of Sura and who had, by means of his great in the year 942-the man, whom he had appointed to the stewardben Zakkai died, and after the lapse of another two years-that is, learning and his fearless championship of the cause of Rabbanite Judaism invested the position of Gaon with new luster and pres-For two years two Exilarchs and two Geonim of Sura were func-

The Book of Beliefs and Opinions

of beliefs. It was begun apparently as a series of independent trea-SAADIA's magnum opus, the Book of Beliefs and Opinions, constiadded as a sort of appendix. tutes the first systematic presentation of Judaism as a rational body the concluding treatise which gives the impression of having been tises, which were later combined into an organic whole, except for

prefaces the body of his Book of Beliefs and Opinions with a In conformity with the procedure in all his writings Saadia

INTRODUCTION

foundest thinker could not entirely dispense. only permissible but a positive duty. This to him, however, did not about the basic dogmas of religion was regarded by Saadia as not do away with the need for revelation with which even the proof the various natural sources of human knowledge to confirm the truth. In order to attain his objective he was going to make use in Israel's Holy Scriptures. Far from being proscribed, speculation truths already divulged by means of the divine revelations recorded unbelief on the other. It was his aim to lead them on to the road of were wavering between blind faith on the one hand and arrogant to write this book was the confusion of his contemporaries who prompted him to undertake its composition and outlines the method he intends to pursue in his argument. What induced him comprehensive introduction in which he states the reasons that

ions is divided deal respectively with The ten main treatises into which the Book of Beliefs and Opin-

- 1) the creation of the world;
- 2) God's unity and other divine attributes;
- 3) the commandments of God and the means of their revelanon;
- 4) man's freedom to either obey or disobey God;
- 5) virtue and vice;
- 6) man's soul and its immortality;
- 7) the doctrine of resurrection;
- 8) the age of the Messiah and of Israel's redemption;
- 10) the golden mean. 9) reward and punishment in the hereafter; and

world came into being, disproving the tenability of twelve disrational proofs. Thus, for example, in the first treatise he establishes supported from Scripture and tradition as well as by means of Jewish conception of the unity of God over against the Christian senting views which he lists. In the second treatise he upholds the the doctrine of creatio ex nihilo as the correct theory of how the are refuted by him, while what he considers the right teaching is a summary of the most important divergent opinions. These latter In all of these treatises the author presents besides his own view

dogma of the trinity and Zoroastrian dualism. In the third, after demonstrating the necessity of revelation, he polemizes against the Christian and Mohammedan claims of the abrogation of the Mosaic Law. In the fourth he argues against the allegation that man is hampered in his freedom of choice by God's foreknowledge of things. The sixth treatise contains a rejection of six unacceptable views of the nature of the human soul as well as a refutation of the theory of metempsychosis. The seventh takes up various arguments propounded against the doctrine of resurrection and tries to show that they are all null and void. In the eighth the Christian teaching concerning the Messiah is refuted. In the ninth, again, in addition to proving the necessity of reward and punishment in the hereafter, the objections against this theory are reviewed and answered.

In discussing the various subjects Saadia makes use of illustrations derived from nearly all the sciences cultivated in his time and surroundings, from medicine, anatomy, mathematics, astronomy, and even music. He drives home his points by means of apt quotations from the Bible, which is cited by him no less than 1,300 times. Even though as a Gaon he was the authority in his day on the Talmud, he makes comparatively sparing use of this source of Jewish tradition, apparently because it was his desire to defeat with their own weapons the Karaites who accepted only the Written Law as binding. The views of these sectarians, which Saadia combatted throughout his life, are, indeed, mentioned several times directly in the *Book of Beliefs and Opinions* but more often by

In his philosophical ideas Saadia might best be characterized as an eclectic although he followed in the arrangement of his book the pattern of the works of the Mohammedan theologians of his time known as the Mutakallimun, particularly those of the school of the Mu'tazilites, whose philosophical treatises usually revolved about the two subjects of *unity* and *justice*, that is, the nature of the Creator and man's freedom of will.

The original Arabic text of the Book of Beliefs and Opinions, was published by S. Landauer (Leyden, 1880) on the basis of a

INTRODUCTION

Bodleian manuscript and with the use of the variants presented by the manuscript of the Leningrad library. A second version of the seventh treatise, which was the one used by Ibn Tibbon and which is contained in the Leningrad recension, was edited by W. Bacher in the Steinschneider Festschrift (Leipzig, 1896, Hebrew section, pp. 98–112).

Although paraphrases in Hebrew of Saadia's Book of Beliefs and Opinions were made much earlier, the first literal translation into Hebrew of the entire work, which according to the author's own dating had been completed in the year 933, was that of Judah ibn Tibbon, finished in the year 1186 in Lunel, Southern France. Of the seven individual editions of this Hebrew translation that have appeared since the editio princeps of Constantinople (1562), that of Josefow (1885) with the commentary Sčbhil ha-'Emunah by Israel ha-Levi is undoubtedly the best.

The only complete rendering into a modern language of the book to have made its appearance hitherto is that of Julius Fürst (Leipzig, 1845), who translated all but the last treatise into German. In reality, however, Fürst's work is a paraphrase rather than a translation of the original, and a very inadequate one at that, for the reason that he was able to utilize only Ibn Tibbon's Hebrew version, which on account of its terminology and its slavish adherence to the syntax of the Arabic text is very difficult to understand without the use of the driginal.

Other Writings of Saadia Gaon

IF Saadia had produced nothing else than the Book of Beliefs and Opinions, his claim to live in the memory of posterity would have been established. The fact is, however, that he was a most prolific writer, whose literary works extended over many branches of knowledge, in a number of which he was not only a pioneer but an unexcelled master. The fields of learning covered in his writings have been described by H. Malter in his Life and Works of Saadia Gaon as follows:

XXVII

- A) Hebrew philology (comprising grammar, lexicography, and exegesis);
- B) Liturgy (including poetics in general);
- C) Halakhah in its manifold ramifications (covering the various branches of the Jewish religious and civil law);
- D) Calendar and chronology (largely polemical);
- E) Philosophy (especially the philosophy of religion and embracing the author's systems of ethics and psychology);
- F) Polemics against the Karaites and other opponents of traditional Judaism (of diversified content and written at various periods of the author's life).

Listing Saadia's works in accordance with this scheme we may say that we have in his 'Agron, in the first part of which Hebrew words were arranged in alphabetical order according to their initial letters and in the second part of which the final letters were arranged alphabetically to facilitate versification, the first Hebrew dictionary. In his Books on Language, again, a grammatical work in twelve parts written in Arabic, we have the oldest known grammar of the Hebrew language. Besides these he also wrote an explanation of ninety so-called hapax legomena and other very rare Hebrew and Aramaic words of the Bible.

Saadia was the first to translate the Hebrew Scriptures into Arabic, and this version is still used by Jews in Arabic-speaking countries. The translation is on the whole literal, paraphrase being resorted to only when found to be absolutely necessary. Just as in the Targum of Onkelos anthropomorphisms are avoided and unfamiliar names are rendered by appellatives known to the Arabicspeaking reader.

According to a catalogue of Saadia's works discovered among the Genizah fragments (see J. Mann in *Jewish Quarterly Review*, *n.s.*, XI, and S. Poznanski, *idem*, Vol. XIII) Saadia wrote commentaries in Arabic on about one half of the Pentateuch, as well as on Isaiah, the twelve minor prophets, Psalms, Proverbs, Job, Lamentations, Esther, and Daniel. These were usually provided, as was his custom, with full introductions, and they discussed many of the subjects from the philosophical as well as the philological stand-

INTRODUCTION

XXIX

point. The above-named list speaks also of sermons, not mentioned elsewhere, that he is said to have composed.

In the field of liturgy, too, Saadia's works were epoch-making. His Siddur or "Order of Prayers," which has recently been published in Palestine with a Hebrew translation of the Arabic text, synagogue, is valuable also as the record of many liturgical compositions—other than the basic prayers—emanating from authors who would otherwise have remained unknown. However besides being a systematizer and classifier of the works of others Saadia was also a religious poet in his own right, who tried his hand at almost every type of liturgical poetry in vogue in his day. Most of his verses that have been transmitted to us seem extremely his Bakkašoth that have been preserved, reveal deep religious fervor and real grace and purity of style.

In his capacity of Gaon, the head of the Talmudical academy of Sura and the chief Jewish legal authority in the world, Saadia's prime concern was with Jewish law. In this field, too, as Louis Ginzberg notes in his Geonica, "Rabbi Saadia was the most important author of the Geonic time," distinguishing himself not only by the number but also by the originality of his contributions to Halakic literature. He is quoted as having written an *Introduc-He* composed an *Interpretation of the Thirteen* (*Hermeneutical*) *Rules (of Rabbi Ishmael*). Both of these were written originally ous tractates of the Talmud, likewise in the Arabic tongue.

Of particular interest in the Halakic field, however, are his monographs on various legal subjects, which he treated with his characteristic thoroughness. The following titles are quoted: 1. On Inheritance; 2. On Pledges; 3. On Testimony and Contracts; 4. On Incest; 5. On Meat Disgualified for Food (terphah); 6. On Usury; 5. On Defilement and Purity; 8. On (legal) Gifts; 9. On the Gifts Due to the Priests; 10. On the Laws Concerning Menstruation. The only one of these works preserved in its entirety is the first.

medan jurisprudence. It, too, was written in Arabic. It reveals in its style as well as its method the influence of Moham-

either in Arabic or in Aramaic, the official language of the Geonim. tions directed to him as Gaon that Saadia wrote from time to time Finally mention must be made of numerous response to ques-

ern countries but to those of Egypt and elsewhere too. calendar as accepted by the Babylonians and those advocated by dealing with the differences between the four principal rules of the astronomy. At the request of the Exilarch David ben Zakkai he mer of the year 922, were sent not only to the communities of East. their opponents. Copies of this book, which was written in the sum drew up A Record-Book and Memorial Scroll for Generations, which demanded a considerable knowledge of mathematics and reveals him as an expert on the Jewish calendar, the regulation of The leading role that Saadia played in the Ben Meir controversy

of the Calendar. one in Arabic, soliciting the assistance of his pupils in Egypt in suppressing Ben Meir's changes; and The Order (or Mysteries) with the accepted calculations; three Letters, two in Hebrew and Festivals on the appointment of the Jewish festivals in accordance the four principles of the traditional calendar; the Book of the In addition he is quoted as having composed the Four Gates on

and his generals. of The Scroll of the Hasmoneans, which gives a detailed and partly also to have written, in Hebrew, a Chronology of the Teachers of of a Book of Chronology in seven parts covering the history of the the Mishnah and the Talmud, a Genealogy of Rabbi Judah the world from the creation down to the author's time. He is believed support that it lent to the belief in the uninterrupted continuity of legendary account of the victories of the Maccabees over Antiochus Patriarch, and an Arabic translation of the original Aramaic text Jewish tradition, Saadia is credited with the composition in Arabic In the realm of chronology, the importance of which lay in the

his masterpiece, the Book of Beliefs and Opinions, which is the As far as philosophy is concerned, Saadia wrote, in addition to

INTRODUCTION

of the internal organs of the human body. astral bodies. There is included also a discussion of the functions voice), as well as the measurements of various planets and other Word (of God)," and the "Echo" (that is the resonance of God's vowels of the Hebrew alphabet, the significance of numbers and letters, the process of creation according to the author of the book, the meaning of such terms as sekhinah, "the Holy Spirit," "The rian and the Babylonian pronunciations of the consonants and itself he discusses such matters as the variations between the Tibeof the doctrine of creatio ex nihilo. In the body of the commentary of the creation of the world which he refutes and rejects in favor with which he prefaces his book, he takes up seven Greek theories he ascribed to the patriarch Abraham. In a lengthy introduction, record, on the mystical Book of Creation, the authorship of which subject of our translation, a philosophical commentary, the first on

be found in his Bible exegesis and in other writings as well. Everymentary and the Book of Beliefs and Opinions alone. They are to But Saadia's philosophical remarks are not confined to this com-

and the validity of the Oral Law are discussed. Whether the Book dling of lights on the Sabbath eve, the date of the Feast of Weeks, ters of controversy between Karaites and Rabbanites as the kinacademy of Sura, was his Book of Distinction, in which such matten in 926-927, when he was already officially connected with the him when he was still in Egypt. His most important polemic, writ-Anan, aimed against the founder of Karaism. It was composed by earliest of his polemical writings was one entitled a Refutation of which the controversial purpose was direct and deliberate. The masterpiece the polemic was only incidental, there were others of upholding traditional Judaism and combatting the Karaite schism. However whereas in his exegetical books and in his philosophical of his writings were more or less of a polemical character, even his translation of the Bible which served him as an instrument for polemical literature that he left behind. As a matter of fact most where is there evidence of the rational, scientific bent of his mind. We come now to the last classification of Saadia's works, the

XXXI

of Proofs for Burning Candles on the Sabbath, which is mentioned in the list of Saadia's writings published by Mann, was a part of this work or not has not yet been decided.

Another anti-Karaite work of Saadia's was his Book of Refutation of Ibn Sakawaihi, a Karaite who in a brochure entitled Book of Shameful Things had attacked the essential parts of rabbinic law. It was possibly against the same author that Saadia's Book of Refutation of an Overbearing Antagonist, in which the question of the proper appointment of the festivals of Passover and Tabernacles is dealt with, was directed. His Refutation of Hiuwi al-Balchi, again, was aimed at a Jewish radical, who denied not only the validity of the Talmud but of the Bible as well.

One of Saadia's latest polemics, in which he justified his position in his struggle with the Exilarch and which was composed during his period of seclusion was *The Open Book*. In contradistinction to his previous polemical works it was written in Hebrew instead of Arabic. Later on he issued a sequel in Arabic entitled *The Book That Refutes*.

Saadia Literature in the English Language

THE standard work in any language on the career and the writings of the Gaon Saadia is Henry Malter's *Life and Works of Saadia Gaon* (Philadelphia, 1921). Besides giving a full-length biography of the greatest of the Geonim, Malter has also compiled in this book an exhaustive bibliography of all the works by and about Saadia either extant or quoted at the date of its completion.

Articles dealing with various phases of the life, works, and teachings of Saadia, as well as additional bibliographical lists, are to be found in the following volumes:

Saadia Anniversary Volume, American Academy for Jewish Research, New York, 1943.

Saadia Studies, edited by Abraham A. Neuman and Solomon Zeitlin, Philadelphia, 1943. Special edition of Jewish Quarterly Review, n.s., XXXII (1943), 109-401.

Saadya Studies, edited by Erwin I. J. Rosenthal, Manchester University Press, 1943.

Rab Saadia Gaon, edited by Louis Finkelstein, Jewish Theological Seminary of America, New York, 1944.

THE BOOK OF BELIEFS AND OPINIONS

COMPOSED BY

SA'ID 'IBN YUSUF

[OTHERWISE] KNOWN AS SA'ADYA THE FAYYUMITE

INTRODUCTORY TREATISE

May He be lauded, then, above the highest commendation and demonstrations become lucid for them and proofs become clear. ties are thereby removed from them and doubts disappear, so that and apprehend correctly the objects of their knowledge. Uncertainof which they assess accurately what they perceive with their senses certainty unto rational beings the existence of their souls, by means THE author opened his remarks with the words: of being regarded as the Evident Truth, Who verifies with "Blessed be God, the God of Israel, Who is alone deserving

serving Him, just as His pious one besought Him when he said: tainties from my mind so that I may fully attain the means of truths. As for myself, I invoke God's help in lifting such uncersome men that in their fancy and belief they become established z(Ps. 119:18). Uncover mine eyes that I may behold the marvels of Thy Law show, furthermore, how some of these uncertainties so intrigue 1 these uncertainties, and thus reach the goal of their search. I shall for the truth, as well as of the method by which they may resolve by which uncertainties may beset the minds of men in their search it has been my intention to compose, with an account of the causes brief expression of tribute to Him, I shall preface this book, which Now after these preliminaries in praise of our Lord and our

This [introductory essay], as well as the subject matter of the

dering of Ibn Tibbon. Note. The English translation of the title of the book follows the Hebrew ren-

1. "intrigue"—literally "dominate." Cf. Bloch's translation.

2. "become established"—literally "establish them as."

ot wisdom when it is made accessible: Then wilt thou understand may thereby arrive at equity $\langle 2 \rangle^4$ and truth—as the saint said 2:9). righteousness and justice and equity, yea every good path (Prov grasp and easy to master; and he who diligently studies the book the principal proofs and arguments and not of their subdivisions. terms, in easy rather than difficult language, making use of only book proper,³ I propose to formulate in simple rather than recondite Thus the contents will be plain to follow and simple enough to

could be in doubt about him, for only one of two reasons: either example, if a person were to seek one Reuben, the son of Jacob, he talls short in the thoroughness and persistency of his quest. For either (a) because the seeker is not sufficiently acquainted with perceived by sense are subject to confusion for one of two reasons: arise in the minds of men. I maintain that the concepts of the intelobject with the least effort and the slightest concern, wherefore, might see someone else and think he is Reuben; of (b) because ⁶ be standing 5 before him without being recognized by him, or he the object of his search, or (b) because he takes his task lightly and lect are based on the perceptions of the senses. However, the things indeed, he does not discern it. he takes the easiest course, abandoning thoroughness. The result (a) because he does not know him well, so that the latter might in the latter case] is that his love of ease inclines him to seek his I shall, then, first make note of the cause by which uncertainties

because, even though he is conversant with the processes of reasonconversely, he declares what is no proof to be a valid proof, or (b)dence, so that he declares a valid proof to be no proof and, tellectual knowledge is unacquainted with the methods 7 of evifrom one of these two causes: either (a) because the seeker of in-Similarly in regard to things of the intellect, confusion may arise

3. "book proper"-literally "entire book."

pages will be similarly indicated. 4. Beginning of page 2 of Landauer's edition of the Arabic text. Subsequent

5. "the latter might be standing"-so according to Ibn Tibbon's Hebrew version. "because"-Ibn Tibbon.

7. "methods"-Ibn Tibbon

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

the conclusion before having completed the task of reasoning ing, he takes the quickest and easiest course so that he jumps at

named: They know not neither do they understand (Ps. 82:5). goal or in despair of ever reaching it. Now of the first class of knowledge and understanding (Neh. 10:29), and of the lastindividuals mentioned by us the saint has said: Every one that had knowledge as he has. Such a one would be far removed from his that [deficiency], lack the patience to explore fully such correct he be unacquainted with the art of reasoning and, together with these conditions are combined in the same person! I mean that How [much more would this apply] in the case in which both

was he who had defrauded his debtor. debtor less than what was owing to him, he might fancy that it uncertain whether he had paid it. Or if he were to receive from his weights, nor yet how much money is due him from his debtor. Even if his debtor were to pay him his debt in full, he would be know the art of weighing, or even the nature of a balance and happen to come upon it. He is thus like a creditor ⁹ who does not the truth even if it should by chance occur to him or ⁸ he should distant from his goal, so much so that he would fail to recognize added <3> a third; namely, that the seeker does not know what he is seeking. Such a one would be even further removed and more Still more would this be true where to these two factors is

with the art of sorting. As a consequence he would often accept defective coins and refuse the good. Something like that would else and relies on his own sorting although he is unacquainted compared to a person who receives money for himself or somebody ments and the quantity to be weighed. He might furthermore be himself but is totally ignorant of the nature of weighing instruis also that of the individual who seeks to weigh something for Just like this case of the ignorant creditor who sues his debtor 10

8. "or"—Ibn Tibbon.

9. "creditor"—literally "an individual."

10. "the ignorant creditor who sues his debtor"—literally "the two litigants one of whom sues the other."

also happen where he is acquainted with the art but fails to observe carefully.

saint say, And take not the word of truth utterly out of my mouth their patient penetration into all the phases of their art after acis the speech of the righteous. Thus praise is bestowed on the edge as well as their patience, as it is stated first, Like tested silver sorting are presented as righteous men on account of their knowlthe wicked is of little worth. On the other hand, those expert in because they wrong the truth; Scripture says, namely, The heart of sorting of money when it says, Like tested silver is the speech of (Ps. 119:43). searched out what to say (Job 32: 11). In like manner did the other quainting themselves thoroughly with it, as the saint said, Behold, learned, and doubts are removed from them, only on account of the righteous whilst the heart of the wicked is of little worth I waited for your words, I listened for your reasons whilst ye limited or who have but little patience are presented as wrongdoers, (Prov. 10: 20).¹¹ Those whose knowledge of the art of sorting is Scripture does indeed liken the sorting of just statements to the

What has prompted me to speak explicitly about this matter is my observation of the state of many people in regard to their beliefs and convictions. There is among them, for instance, the type of person who has attained the truth <4> and is cognizant of it and rejoices in it.¹² Of him does the prophet say, *Thy words were* found, and *I* did eat them; and *Thy words were unto me a joy* and the rejoicing of my heart (Jer. 15: 16).

Again there is among them he who has attained the truth but who is nevertheless in doubt about it, being neither wholly convinced nor holding it firmly in his grasp. In reference to him the prophet says, *Though I write for him ever so many things of My Law, they are accounted as a stranger's* (Hos. 8: 12).

There is further among them he who holds to be true what in reality is false, thinking that it is the truth; he thus clings to false-

11. The usual translation is The tongue of the righteness is as choice silver; the heart of the wicked is little worth.

12. "in it"-Ibn Tibbon. These words are omitted in the Arabic text.

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

hood and abandons what is right. Of him Scripture says, Let him not trust in vanity, deceiving himself; for vanity shall be his recompense (Job. 15: 31).

There is, lastly, among them the type of person who for a while some flaw that he has noticed in it. So he transfers to another system from which he also withdraws on account of some point in it which up again on account of something in it which has made it repreone might be compared to a person who wishes to go to a certain walks a parasang along one highway and hesitates. Then he turns and so turns once more and repeats this procedure on a third fools wearieth every one of them, for he knoweth not. When, now T consident of the knoweth not.

When, now, I considered these fundamentals and the evil resulting therefrom, my heart was grieved for my species, the species ple, the children of Israel. For I saw in this age of mine many besound, whilst many of the deniers of the faith boasted of their though they were themselves in error. I saw, furthermore, men who of confusion and looked down upon the devotees of the truth alwere sunk, as it were, in seas of doubt and overwhelmed by waves depths nor a swimmer who might take hold of their hands and carry them ashore.

But inasmuch as my Lord had granted me some knowledge by which $\langle 5 \rangle$ I might come to their assistance and had endowed me with some ability that I could put at their disposal for their benefit, I thought that it was my duty to help them therewith and my obligation to direct them to the truth. Something of this order was also expressed by the saint: The Lord God hath given me the

tongue of them that are taught, that I should know how to sustain with words him that is weary; He wakeneth morning by morning, He wakeneth my car to hear as they that are taught (Isa. 50:4).

Although I do acknowledge that my learning is far from perfect and admit that my scientific attainments are lacking in excellence, and I am not wiser than my contemporaries, yet according to my capacity and to the extent of my understanding and as the saint expressed it, But as for me, this secret is not revealed to me for any wisdom that I have more than any living, but to the intent that the interpretation may be made known to the king, and that thou mayest know the thoughts of thy heart (Dan. 2: 30)—I beseech God, exalted be He, to help me and grant me what He knows to be the aim and object of my quest, not according to my attainments and my powers, as His other saint said, I know also, my God, that Thou triest the heart, and hast pleasure in uprightness (I Chron. 29: 17).

I also adjure by God, the Creator of the universe, any scholar who, upon studying this book, sees in it a mistake, that he correct it, or, should he note an abstruse phrase, that he substitute for it a more felicitous one. Let him not feel restrained therefrom by the fact that the book is not his work, or that I had anticipated him in explaining what had not been clear to him. For the wise have a tender solicitude for wisdom, entertaining for it a sympathy similar to that entertained for one another by members of the same family, as Scripture says: Say unto wisdom: "Thou art my sister" (Prov. 7:4)—although the fools, too, are devoted to their folly, and are loath to forsake it, as Scripture says: Though he spare it, and will not let it go, but keep it still within <6> his mouth (Job 20: 13).

Furthermore I implore in the name of God, exalted be He, every seeker of knowledge who studies this book to read it without bias and have in mind the same objective as I, and to desist from narrow-mindedness and conjecture and confutation, until he will have obtained benefit and have acquired profit by the power and the might of Him, who teaches us what profits us, as the saint has said: I am the Lord thy God, that teaches thee for thy profit, that leadeth thee by the way that thou shouldest go (Isa. 48: 17).

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

If, now, the scholar and the student will pursue such a course in the perusal of this book, then he that strives for certainty will gain in certitude, and doubt will be lifted from the doubter, and he that believes by sheer authority will come to believe out of insight and understanding. By the same token the gratuitous opponent will come to a halt, and the conceited adversary will feel ashamed, whilst the righteous and upright will rejoice, as Scripture says: The upright see it, and are glad, and all iniquity stoppeth her mouth. Whoso is use, let him observe these things, and let them consider the mercies of the Lord (Ps. 107: 42, 43).

Thus will men improve in their inner being as well as in their outer conduct. Their prayers, too, will become pure, since they will have acquired in their hearts a deterrent from error, an impulse to do what is right, as the saint has said: Thy word have I laid up in my heart, that I might not sin against Thee (Ps. 119: 11).

Thus, also, will their beliefs prevail in their affairs, their mutual jealousy over things of this world will diminish. They will all tend toward the realm of wisdom and feel no inclination for anything else. Theirs will be salvation and mercy and grace as He, may He be praised and sanctified, has said: Look unto Me, and be ye saved, all the ends of the earth; for I am God, and there is none else (Isa. 45: 22).

All this will become possible when doubts are dispelled and uncertainties removed. For then the knowledge of God and acquaintance with His lore will spread even as water spreads at the shores ¹³ of the sea—as Scripture says: For the earth shall be full of the knowledge of the Lord, as the waters cover the sea (Isa. 11:9).

III

<7> Now someone might perhaps ask: ¹⁴ What was the purpose of ¹⁵ the Creator, exalted and magnified be He, in permitting these uncertainties and doubts to prevail among His creatures? To

13. "shores"—literally "parts."

14. "ask"-Ibn Tibbon.

15. "What was the purpose of"—Ibn Tibbon

is extracted dissociated from any doubt. condition. Now the process of knowing on the part of men begins ties] until the uncertainties depart from them and the pure essence with things that are at first jumbled, obscure and ambiguous. in the course of time, continually refine and purify these [complexi-However by the power of the intellect, which they possess they do, which is one of these activities, obviously depends upon a like which to complete that act step by step. Cognition, therefore, uncertainties and illusions. That is to say: by the plan of creation, fact of their being created entities necessitates their entertaining this question we here offer an answer. We maintain that the very they require for every act they perform a span of time within

ambiguity or doubt. sole object of his quest is extracted and left isolated, [free] from all stop in their endeavors before these phases were completed, the them these problems decrease, until at the last of these stages, the Thus each time that man's reasoning and reflection are applied to which at the second are reduced to nine, and at the third to eight. end. At the initial stage, for example, there may be ten problems, one start in it at the beginning and proceed step by step until its completed. In like manner does the art of cognition require that perseverance of the worker to the last phase, would never be or other tasks, that can be brought to completion only by the operation in question, such as sowing or building or weaving Now, since all human arts consist of phases, if men were to

that from these types of sound he could not derive any proof. So stone on stone, and 2) the cleaving of certain bodies, and 3) sounds produced by 1) the concussion of bodies, such as the falling of out to distill the object of his quest-and the sounds confronting sound, and sounds are of many types. When, then, the seeker sets like that of thunder and crashing and similar noises, for he knows him, which he has begun to classify, are ambiguous and unintelligible—he first eliminates <8> from the complex of noises those Now such a proof is a statement, and a statement is a kind of looking for proof by means of which he might arrive at the truth. For the sake of elucidation let it be assumed that a person is

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

II

E, each by itself. rately, would serve any purpose, as if thou wert to say: A, B, C, D, nected consonants, since none of them, when pronounced sepaletters of the alphabet. From these, again, he eliminates unconlate ¹⁷ sounds produced by man, which consist of the twenty-two use to him, so that, in the fourth stage, he comes upon the articunatural sounds as "Ah" and the like, since these would be of no knowledge [is expressed]. From these, again, he eliminates such arrives, in the third stage, at the sounds produced by human beings in particular, since it is by this species of sounds [only] that all ing and the like, since these are no less unintelligible.16 Thus he not endowed with speech, such as neighing and braying and lowwill eliminate from these the sounds made by all animated things expect to find the [desired] demonstration. Next, however, he beings only, seeing that it is among these [alone] that he may he arrives, in the second stage, at sounds produced by animated

who says: "The sun has risen," or "The rain has fallen," and the seventh stage, upon statements such as those made by the person does not constitute a statement, and he thus comes, <9> in the and a noun or more, for he expects by means of these combinations to attain his object. From these he now eliminates instances of the writing"; and other such combinations of two words, or of a word of] connected speech, as when one says: "A star shining"; "A man designated by them. Thus he arrives, in the sixth stage, at [sounds nouns, when spoken in isolation, to indicate any more than what is "heaven," "star," "man," since it is not inherent 18 in any of these stance of a noun that is detached, spoken alone, as when one says: or more consonants. From these, however, he eliminates every in-[mere] coupling of two or more words or of any [utterance] that one another so as to form nouns, consisting each of two or three He now arrives, in the fifth stage, at consonants combined with

He knows, however, that statements are [divided] into three

16. "these are no less unintelligible"—literally "there is no wisdom in them."

17. "articulate"—or "technical."

18. "inherent"---so Ibn Tibbon, literally "in the nature."

different categories: (a) necessary, such as the statement: "The fire is hot"; (b) impossible, such as the statement: "The fire is cold"; (c) possible, such as the statement: "Reuben is in Bagdad." He thereupon puts aside the necessary and the impossible categories, and arrives, in the eighth stage, at the possible [type of] statement, and investigates whether what is contained in it ¹⁹ is correct or not.

Then, in the ninth stage, he begins to subject the matter in question to rational analysis, either [starting] from a necessary [premise] and demonstrating—by means of certain methods which we shall elucidate hereafter—that by that premise the matter under discussion, too, must be affirmed as necessary; ²⁰ or starting from an impossible premise and showing that by it any such statement must be declared impossible. When, then, all the alternatives have been excluded and there remains only the one he has reached in the tenth stage, which is now lucid and clear to him, he drops from his mind all previous divisions that had rendered his objectives both ambiguous and obscure before his inquiry had eliminated these divisions one by one.

It is clear, then, that the person who speculates begins with a great many things that are all mixed up, from which he continually sifts nine out of ten, and then eight out of nine, and then seven out of eight, until all confusions and ambiguities are removed and only the pure extract remains. If, therefore, he were to stop in his investigation upon reaching the fifth or the fourth stage or whatever station it be, the number of uncertainties resolved by him would be in proportion to the stations he has put behind himself, and he would still be left with a number proportionate to the stations before him. Should he hold on to what he has accomplished, there is hope that he may come back to it and complete the process. If, however, he does not retain it, then he would be compelled to repeat the entire process of reasoning from the beginning.

19. "is contained in it"—literally "the informant stated concerning it."
20. "that by that . . . necessary"—literally "the necessary conclusions that it leads to."

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

It is on this account that many people remain in error, spurning wisdom. Some do it because they do not know the road leading to it. Certain others [take this attitude] because, although they had pletely, and were, therefore, among those who perished, as Scriping shall rest in the congregation of the shades (Prov. 21: 16). The sages of the children of Israel have also said with reference to him the number of disciples of Hillel and Shammai increased who did the number of disagreements (Sanh. 88b). This utterance of theirs no controversy or discord arises among them.

Let, therefore, the worried fool refrain from ascribing his failings to the Creator, exalted and magnified be He. Let him not say that it was He who had implanted the doubts in him. Rather doubts, as we have explained. In fact it is untenable that a single act on his part should instantaneously remove all uncertainties. Creatures, and he is, after all, a created being. Furthermore, if a person does refrain from assigning this failing of his to his Master, yet desires that God endow him with a knowledge free from all For, as we shall explain in what follows, he who is capable of Creator of the universe, blessed and hallowed be He.

But, as far as all created beings are concerned, they cannot acquire knowledge except by the mediation of a cause; that is, by the process of research and analysis, the performance of which reingly, from the first to the last moment of these intervals, they will of necessity find themselves in a state of uncertainty, as we have shown. Those, then, are worthy of commendation who wait patiently until they have purified the silver of the dross, in ac-

says: A tree of life is she to them that hold on to her (Prov. 3: 18). of their trees has ripened and become nourishment, as Scripture reap according to mercy (Hos. 10:12); or, again, until the fruit ture says: Sow <11> to yourselves according to righteousness, or, until their seed is fully grown and they can harvest it, as Scrip and the wringing of the nose bringeth forth blood (Prov. 30: 33); ance of Scripture: For the churning of milk bringeth forth curd, cordance with the statement of Scripture: Take away the dross from the silver, and there cometh forth a vessel for the refiner (Prov. 25: 4); or, until they have distilled the clear milk of the ar [of research] and extracted its cream, according to another utter-

Z

instruction from His mouth (Job 22:22). nent ruin (Prov. 10:14); and it says also: Receive, I pray thee, men lay up knowledge; but the mouth of the foolish is an immioccasions, in accordance with the statement of Scripture: Wise He then deposits it in his soul for a future occasion or for future becomes convinced of the truth of the notion he has thus acquired through them acquired and digested by the souls, then the person emerges, [and] is embraced and enfolded by the minds and, anything that is apprehended. When the cream of investigation notion that arises in the soul in regard to the actual character of behooves us to explain what is meant by belief. We say that it is a it desirable, the matter of resolving uncertainties and doubts, it And now that we have finished expounding, as much as we felt

that what exists is nonexistent, and what is nonexistent exists. existent. A false belief, on the other hand, consists in believing a white, and that what exists exists, and what is nonexistent is nonmuch is much, and little is little, and black is black, and white is little, and little is much, and white is black, and black is white, and thing to be the opposite of what it actually is, such as that much is lief consists in believing a thing to be as it really is; namely, that Now beliefs fall into two categories: true and false. A true be-

The praiseworthy wise man is he who makes reality his guiding

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

from evil; but the fool behaveth overbearingly, and is confident by Scripture, which says: ²² A wise man feareth, and departeth shunned and shuns what is deserving of trust. All this is borne out principle, assuming that reality is patterned after ²¹ his belief. (Prov. 14: 16). Notwithstanding his ignorance, he trusts in what should be hand, is he who sets up his personal conviction as his guiding wherever caution is in order. The reprehensible fool, on the other dom, he relies only on what is deserving of trust and is wary principle and bases his belief thereon. Notwithstanding his wisч С

tune ²⁴ of which he was not [sufficiently] apprehensive. how quickly will he [in such a case] be overcome by the misforsult that he no longer takes precautions against the latter. But, oh, enemy believe that his enemy has died, aye perished, with the rewould happen to him. Or let him among them who has a vicious he is thirsty, or that he is covered up when he is naked, and see what he is sated when he is hungry, or that his thirst is quenched when of age, and see what good it would do him. Or let him assume that let him believe he is seventy years old, when he is only forty years chests are filled with money, and see what it would profit him. Or of mental deterioration.²³ For if they be right, then let him among them who has no money take it into his head that his coffers and individuals are so sunken in folly as to have reached the very nadir existent and whatever they declare to be in existence is so. These that any object the existence of which they deny must be nonslaves, yet believe that they have no master, and who are confident amazement at [the view of] certain people who, being <12>To this [last] observation I must append the expression of my

punishment and other such things. It is such individuals that from [being subject to] His promise of reward and threat of them from [heeding] His commandments and prohibitions and [mere] refusal to acknowledge the sovereignty of the Lord exempts Now it is sheer folly on the part of people to imagine that their

21. "is patterned after"—literally "follows."

22. "All . . . says"—literally "and as it says." 23. "mental deterioration"—literally "perdition."

24. "misfortune"-Ibn Tibbon.

Scripture quotes [as saying]: Let us break their bands asunder (Ps. 2:3).

ture has indeed said: He is wise in heart, and mighty in strength, who has hardened himself against Him, and prospered? (Job 9:4) to escape the lot that His wisdom has decreed for them, as Scripof the universe! Their [mere] ignorance [of it] will not cause them of those who in this wise embolden themselves against the Creator are struck by them. How much more should this apply in the case and the scourge, although they smart from them whenever they ness, have hardened themselves to endure the blows of the cane tact with it. Again there are individuals who, affecting youthfulagainst fire, although it burns them whenever they come in con-Thus there are certain Hindus who have hardened themselves

<

which is inferred by logical necessity. gained by $\langle r_3 \rangle$ [direct] observation. The second is composed of there are three [such] bases. The first consists of the knowledge the intuition of the intellect. The third comprises that knowledge them in keeping with the aim 26 of this book, we declare that knowledge and the mainspring of all cognition. Discoursing about truth and the vouchers of certainty which are the source of all first statement, it behooves us to give an account of the bases of Having concluded now what we thought fit ²⁵ to append to our

conclusions, which, unless they are accepted by the individual as By the knowledge derived from logical necessity, again, is meant such as approbation of truthfulness and disapproval of mendacity. such notions as spring up solely in the mind of a human being smell or taste or touch. By the intuition of the intellect, we mean one of the five senses; that is, by means of sight or hearing or knowledge of observation whatever a person perceives by means of of these roots of knowledge, we say that we understand by the Following up [this] enumeration with an explanation of each

25. "thought fit"-Ibn Tibbon and codex M quoted by Landauer 26. "aim"-so M.

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

order not to deny the latter's manifest activity. never seen it, that every soul is endowed with reason, [merely] in its manifest activity. [We must] also [agree], although we have have never seen it, that man possesses a soul, in order not to deny ference as being correct. Thus we are forced to affirm, although we very well negate either of these two, he must regard the said initions or the perception of his senses. Since, however, he cannot true, would compel his denial of the validity of his rational intu-5

more readily be denied than what is visible. the third more so than the second, and that whatever is invisible can edge the validity of the first two sources [of knowledge] and reject the third. The reason for the difference in their rating of these refute it. Most numerous of all, however, are those who acknowl-Of their thesis, too, we shall make mention in the first treatise and the validity of the first but reject the second and the third [sources] first. More numerous than this group are those that acknowledge [type of] knowledge is more recondite than the first, and likewise [various sources of knowledge] lies in the fact that the second the second and the third, since the latter two are based upon the view. By rejecting the first source, they have automatically rejected in the first treatise of this book, together with a refutation of their of them reject the first source. Of these we shall give an account liability of] these three sources [of knowledge]. A small minority Now we find that there are many people who deny [the re-

by his opponent dubious and unconvincing. denies the reality of rest. Each one declares the evidence adduced Another, again, affirms that all things move, and by virtue thereof are at rest. < 14 > He consequently denies the reality of motion. particular conclusion. Thus there is he who affirms that all things argument [in each case] is that logical necessity led them to the each group among them affirming what its opponent negates. Their of] knowledge in certain instances 27 and recognize 28 it in others, Again there are people who reject the validity of this [last type

^{27. &}quot;instances"---so M.

Review, XXXIII, 290, and n. 139. 28. "recognize"—literally "hold on to," so Ibn Tibbon. Cf. also Abraham Heschel, The Quest for Certainty in Saadia's Philosophy in The Jewish Quarterly

As for ourselves, the community of monotheists, we hold these three sources of knowledge to be genuine. To them, however, we add a fourth source, which we have derived by means of the [other] three, and which has thus become for us a further principle. That is [to say, we believe in] the validity of authentic tradition, by reason of the fact that it is based upon the knowledge of the senses as well as that of reason, as we shall explain in the third treatise of this book.

At this point, however, we remark that this type of knowledge (I mean that which is furnished by authentic tradition and the books of prophetic revelation), corroborates for us the validity of the first three sources of knowledge. Thus it enumerates the senses in connection with the denial of their functioning in the case of the idols, making them a total of five with two more added to them. It says, namely: *They have mouths but they speak not; eyes have they but they see not*... *neither speak they with their throat* (Ps. 115: 5–7).

The first five [organs] mentioned refer to the senses themselves, whilst of the two [functions] that are added to them, one is motion. This is implied in the statement: *Feet have they but walk not* (Ps. 115:7). By means of this faculty [incidentally] there is also obtained consciousness of heaviness and lightness. Thus a person may be prevented from moving about [freely] by reason of his weight, whereas he would not thus be hindered if he were light. On this account, indeed, certain people were minded to add to the number of the senses, for they asked [themselves]: "How [else] can the sensation of lightness and heaviness be experienced?" Our answer is: "By means of the sense ²⁹ of motion, according to whether the latter is found to be easy or difficult."

The other one [of the added faculties] is [that of] speech. It is implied in the statement: Neither speak they with their throat. [By] that [of course] is [meant] speech in general, [whether it consists] of individual nouns or combinations [of words], or premises, or proofs, as we have previously explained.

Furthermore [authentic tradition] verifies for us the validity

29. "sense"-M and Ibn Tibbon

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

of the intuition of reason. It enjoins us, namely, to speak the truth and not to lie. Thus it says: For my mouth shall utter truth, and wickedness is an abomination to my lips. All the words of my mouth are in righteousness, there is nothing <15> perverse or crooked in them (Prov. 8:7, 8).

Besides that it confirms for us the validity of knowledge inferred by logical necessity, [that is to say] that whatever leads to the re-The untenability of any [theory] that rejects the perception of the senses is affirmed by such Scripture statements as: Thou that tearest thyself in thine anger, shall the earth be forsaken for thee, or shall the rock be removed out of its place? (Job 18:4). Again, apropos of cerning the falseness or truth [of propositions], it remarks: And nothing worth? (Job 24:25).

Next [tradition] informs us that all sciences are [ultimately] based on what we grasp with our aforementioned senses, from which they are deduced and derived. Thus it says: Hear my words, it was men; and give ear unto me, ye that have knowledge. For over this last source of knowledge also confirms for us the validity tell thee, hear thou me; and that which I have seen will I declareunto whom alone the land was given, and have not hid it; among them (Job 15: 17-19). The [reliability of the] referred to depends, of course, on conditions which we have explained in the interpretation of these verses in their [respective] places.

Having given an account of these four sources of knowledge, it behooves us [now] to explain how they are to be used for purposes for evidence. We say, then, that as far as the knowledge [derived] our senses, by virtue of the connection existing between us and the object in question, must be acknowledged by us to be in truth as it

10

will not he led astray by such fancies as the one referred to by off as red as blood (II Kings 3:22). Scripture in its statement: And the Moabites saw the water way nition of what is perceived with the senses will be correct, and we long, then, as we beware of such illusions and the like, our cogwater is deeper in measurement than the length of the figure. So that <16> the cause of that [illusion] resides in the fact that the reality which was created at that [particular] time, not knowing the figure, which appears reversed in the water, as possessing a property of polished bodies to reflect the outline of objects facing image that has really been created there, when in fact it is only a who believe that the image which they see in the mirror is an astray by them. [We should not, for example, act] like those people has been perceived by us, without [the admission of] a doubt. them. Nor [should we be deceived] like those people who regard nciently | experienced in detecting illusions so as not to be led [This is, of course] posited on the assumption that we are [suf

are, namely, people who definitely consider these dreams to be sort] is to be regarded as true knowledge about which no doubt ceived in our mind in complete freedom from accidents [of any affairs that flitted through the mind, of which Scripture says: realities created in the forms seen by a person. They feel compelled clusion, being wary [at the same time] of fancy and dreams. There we know how to reason and carry the reasoning process to its conlieve they have seen] may be due partly to the previous day's they have seen with their eyes, not realizing that [what they beto abide by this view, so they maintain, in order not to reject what For a dream cometh through a multitude of business (Eccles. 5:2). [is to be entertained]. [This, too, is] posited on the assumption that Now as for the intuitions of the intellect, anything that is con-

a hungry man dreameth and, behold, he eateth (Isa. 29:8). Others small in quantity. Hereof Scripture says: And it shall be as when proportion in the mixture [of the elements of which the body is may be brought on by the fact that the humor has exceeded its consumed, according to whether they were hot or cold, or great or Some [of these musings] again may be the result of the victuals

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

openeth the ears of men (Job 33: 15, 16). sleep falleth upon men, in slumberings upon the bed; then He in his statement: In a dream, in a vision of the night, when deep heavenly light in the form of a hint or a parable, as Job intimates there is also apt to be mingled with these dreams a glimmer of dreams, and terrifiest me through visions (Job 7: 13, 14). Of course my couch shall ease my complaint"; then thou scarest me with of [unwarranted] sadness and sorrow. In regard to this matter the pain-racked invalid said: When I say: "My bed shall comfort me, On the other hand, excessive dryness would cause the generation ture produce the generation of [uncalled-for] mirth and gaiety. composed], with the consequence that the resulting heat and mois-

there is no negating any of them either. for], since there is no negating of the sense percept in question, may be one, or they may be two or three or four or more than tha: But whatever [figure] they may reach [really makes no difference, tion is maintained only by them. Now these [necessary postulates] many in number, since the validity of the sense percept in quesacknowledge [the existence of] all of them, be they few or edgment [of the reality] $< 17 \ge 0$ of other things, then we must upheld in our minds only by virtue of the simultaneous acknowlbeen verified, and [the belief in the reality of] that thing can be whenever our senses perceive anything the existence of which has As for the knowledge which is inferred by logical necessity,

an existing human being. of that human being, since a human voice can emanate only from human being from behind a wall, we must assume the existence only by means of the other. Likewise if we hear the voice of a originates. We must [in that case] assume the existence of the fire because of the existence of the smoke since the one can be effected that we see smoke, but do not see the fire from which that smoke As an illustration of a single [concomitant] let it be supposed

being, and its refuse come out from it, then, unless we assume for instance, we see food go down in bulk in the belly of an animate non that must be postulated, the following might be cited.] When, As an example, again, of more than one [concomitant phenome-

ceived by the senses could be effected only by means of these four digestion and disintegration, and a force that expels the refuse ried out. That is [to say] that there must be in the belly of that that is in it as it goes out. Now inasmuch as what has been perholds it until it has been digested, and a force that furthers its being a force that draws the food into the interior, and a force that been perceived by our senses could not possibly have been car-[operations], we must assume that these four [forces] are a reality. [that] four operations [were involved in the process], what has

ences], it follows of necessity that we must acknowledge all of the such sciences. Once, however, it is realized that the sense percept in question is dependent [for its corroboration] on the said [scithat verifies it for us. We may even be compelled to resort to many we observe becomes possible only by the invention of a science may be upheld. latter as valid so that the reality of the sense percept in question Sometimes, too, our acknowledgment of the reality of what

tions at one and the same time, let alone three or four motions. evitable conclusion that the moon has many motions and that of the constellations] ³⁰ and at another to the north. From this we or it consumes more time and so passes the latter. < 18 > We note, eight stations that we have distinguished and designated by name bodies, since one body cannot be endowed with two different mothese multiple motions can be due only to a multiple number of therefore, that we see these two [factors] vary leads to the invariation in either the speed 31 of its course or its extent. The fact, infer that, if it had only one motion, there could have been no furthermore, that at one time it travels to the south [of the sphere consumes less time than is required for reaching one of the twentyagain at different moments of the night and the day. It does this by tollowing either a long or a short route, according to whether it Thus, for example, we see the moon rise upon the earth and set

tura, La Philosophie de Saadia Gaon, p. 85, n. 26. 30. So according to the exposition by Abraham ben Hiyy- quoted by Moise Ven-31. Cf. ibid.

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

crease the speeds of their respective motions. equal in form intercept each other, they thereby diminish or in-Furthermore [we know] that, when a multiple number of bodies

our hypothesis of the variation of the moon's course by natural law can be upheld. these sciences as being correct, since it is only by means of them that motions. We must, therefore, acknowledge [the theorems of] all clear to us that the moon's course is a composite of five distinct spherical or circular, and that some are concentric with others. ables us to recognize that the figures of the heavenly bodies are geometry. Having acquainted ourselves with [the properties of] concentric, the tangent, and the secant, until we get to know the its segments is impossible and which is tenable. This finally enproperties of the intercepting [spherical] figure,³² and which of other. [That is to say] we must first master the science of plane etry, which shows us synthetically how one figure enters into the plane figures, such as the triangle, the square, the circle, the points and lines, we begin with the study [of the properties] of Once these sciences have been thoroughly mastered, it becomes [All] this is demonstrable only by means of the science of geom-

assumption would fall to the ground. to be true in order not to negate a percept of the senses," we must hypothesis than the one he puts forth. For in the latter event his inquire whether that percept might not be sustained by some other then, that when someone declares: "I believe such and such a thing variation of their evidence center about it or are due to it. We say, served against defect, for most of the controversies of men and the obtained by logical inference, we must note how it may be pre-And now that we have explained the character of knowledge

possible. This whiteness might, for instance, be an ascending mist, test their hypothesis, we find that another [explanation] is equally merly been circled by the sphere of the sun. However, when we of its whiteness which they observe, that the Milky Way had for-32. "until . . . figure"-added by Ibn Tibbon and M. <19> Thus, for example, there are those who believe, because

ground. or a permanent particle of fire, or a conglomerate of little stars, or some other such thing. Their allegation, therefore, falls to the

ground so far as we are concerned. center of the universe. Their conclusion, therefore, falls to the ready accorded by us to man, who dwells on the earth, which is the kept in the center. However, such [a position of distinction] is alworld], it being acknowledged that whatever is highly prized is view] is that thereby the fire would be located in the center [of the this one in which we live. Their argument [in support of this are those who maintain that there exists another earth aside from sumption of his becomes null and void. Thus, for example, there by a hypothesis other than the one propounded by him, that asinquiry [into the matter]. [For] if that concept could be upheld to be true in order not to negate a rational concept," we must make Again, if someone were to say: "I believe such and such a thing

more deserving of being accepted as such. nomena | are encountered, the more important of the two is the search for explanatory hypotheses, two such [contradictory pheall things, since it does not stand up by itself. When, then, in the consider, however, the water's visible tendency to percolate and flow over. It is, therefore, impossible that it should be the origin of cause animals originate from the humid element. They fail to those who maintain that all things were created from water, beand of the arguments that support it. Thus, for example, there are must decide in favor of the more important of the two percepts, with the senses." It so happens, however, that that assumption on such a thing to be true by way of analogy with what is perceived his part would invalidate another sense percept. In that case one Suppose, again, that someone were to say: "I believe such and

do not recall, however, that the killing of them would please their which gives us pleasure, because that is how they feel it to be. They void. Thus there are those who maintain that the good is that part of his theory contradicts another, then his theory is null and to be true by way of analogy with a certain sense percept," but one Again, if someone were to say: "I believe such and such a thing

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

them. The act would consequently be good and evil at one and enemies just as much as the killing of their enemies would please the same time, [which is, of course,] a contradiction. К

that they should have perceived in its prime what exists since cause we do not regard as real anything except what our senses believing that all things exist since eternity, because it is impossible real except what their senses perceive would prevent them from perceive." However, the fact that they do not regard anything as clare: "We believe that all things have existed since eternity be conclusion other than that which he believes to be true. <20>a thorough investigation of that reason, we find that it leads to a the theory of the proponents of the eternity of the world who deand such a thing to be true for such and such a reason," but upon That reason would then be voided. Thus, for example, there is Suppose, furthermore, that someone were to say: "I believe such

exalted be He, is willing. we shall note in part of the second treatise of this book, if God, selves into something worse by ascribing to God an absurdity, as not to ascribe to Him impotence. They thereby, however, let themsought to avoid. Thus, for example, certain monotheists shunned the view that God was unable to bring back yesterday in order theory] more difficult [of entertainment] than the one he had and such a reason." Yet thou findest that he ventured into [a Again someone may say: "I reject such and such a thesis for such

contradict another, let alone (e) that a theory be adopted that is worse than the one that has been rejected. invalidate any other [accepted] fact, nor (d) must one part of it itively] apprehended [by reason]. Furthermore (c) it must not senses], nor (b) any other [method] of upholding what is [intuin question] of sustaining the truth of what is perceived [with the above-mentioned five types of vitiating factors. [We must,] namely, edge obtained by logical inference, we must guard it against the [make certain] (a) that there is no other [means than the theory [All] these [precautions are to be taken] in addition to exer-So, then, if we seek to establish the truth in the domain of knowl-

duction to my commentary on the Torah. already done for an extensive portion of this subject in the introplaining the properties of these books, something that I have mean the books of prophecy. However, this is not the place for exwe proceed with the subject matters of authentic tradition-I as well as acceptable, we shall make use of it. Similarly also must means of these seven [criteria]. If, upon being rubbed by their truth. Should, therefore, someone come to us with an allegation touchstone and weighed by their balance, it turns out to be correct in the realm of inferential knowledge, we would test his thesis by observed to make possible for us the accurate emergence of the the quality of perseverance until the process of reasoning has cising, in the determination of the sense percepts and the rational been completed, and we have a total of seven points that must be concepts, such expert care as we have outlined before. Add to these

Z

the last judgment on foot. And many other such ridiculous [stories does not have a she-camel slaughtered on his grave is brought to educated Arabs that they are under the impression that whoever which it becomes eclipsed. [It is] also [related] about certain uncomes rich. It has likewise been reported about certain uneducated country labor under the impression that whoever goes to India besomething resembling a whale swallows the moon as a result of people of our own nation that they labor under the illusion that the uneducated among them. Thus thou seest the masses of this thereto, however, is that such an opinion is held only $\langle 21 \rangle$ by tion leads to unbelief and is conducive to heresy?" Our reply approve of such an occupation, being of the opinion that speculabecome firmly fixed in the mind, when there are people who disestablished as convictions according to the laws of geometry and edge and their investigation to the point where these would be upon ourselves to indulge in speculation about the objects of knowl-Now someone might, of course, ask: "But how can we take it

are circulated].

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

and Elihu. figuring in the Book of Job—I mean, Job, Eliphaz, Bildad, Zophar, nature on this subject were moreover made by the five persons selves what is good (Job 34:4). Extensive statements of a similar Let us choose for us that which is right; let us know among ourthermore there is the remark made by the saints to each other: ye not understood the foundations of the earth? (Isa. 40: 21). Fur-Hear ye not? Hath it not been told you from the beginning? Have enjoin us to do this very thing apropos of authentic tradition, as it is evident from the declaration [of the prophet]: Know ye not? gaging in genuine speculation]. For did not our Creator Himself it is inconceivable that they should have prohibited us from [enwe would reply—and we ask the Merciful One to stand by us-that is above, what was before and what will be behind?'" (Hăgh. 11b), better off had he not been born; namely, What is below and what ever speculates about the following four matters would have been speculation about the beginning of time and place, saying: Whoof the children of Israel forbid this sort of occupation, and especially Should one say, however: "But did not the foremost of the sages

these is to have verified in fact what we have learned from the the matters of our religion with two objectives in mind. One of that studiest this book, that we inquire into and speculate about congregation of the children of Israel, we engage in research and speculation in a way other than this. It is this method of ours that sin, even though he be a professional thinker. As for ourselves, the agreed, then, on charging one who behaves in this fashion with tainty that might arise in his mind and corrupt his belief. We are is not secure against being deprived of it again by some uncer-I wish to describe and clarify with the help of the Merciful One. aside and accept any private notion that might occur to an individhas hit upon the teaching of religion and has it firmly in hand, he ual about the beginning of place and time. For whoever speculates however, he would be without religious faith, and even when he in this wise may either hit the mark or miss it. Until he hits it, <22> Know, then, and may God direct thee aright, Oh thou What the sages forbade was only to lay the books of the prophets

prophets of God theoretically. The second is to refute him who argues against us in regard to anything pertaining to our religion. Our Master, blessed and exalted be He, has namely given us

Our Master, blessed and exalted be He, has namely given us complete instructions in regard to our religious requirements through the medium of His prophets. [He did this] after [first] confirming for us their possession of the gifts of prophecy by means of [sundry] miracles and marvels. Thus He has enjoined us to accept these matters as binding and observe them. He has furthermore informed us, however, that, if we would engage in speculation and diligent research, inquiry would produce for us in each instance the complete truth, tallying with His announcement to us by the speech of His prophets. Besides that He has given us the assurance that the godless will never be in a position to offer a proof against our religion, nor the skeptics ³³ [to produce] an argument against our creed.

These facts are borne out by the statement in which God informs us that all things had a beginning, that He was the Creator who originated them, and that furthermore He was one, having no associate with Him. Thus saith the Lord, the King of Israel, and his Redeemer, the Lord of hosts: "I am the first, and I am the last, and beside Me there is no God" (Isa. 44:6).

He tells us also immediately thereafter that, whatever He has commanded or forbidden us to do or informed us about, has been and will be: And who, as I, can proclaim—let him declare it and set it in order for Mc-since I appointed the ancient people? And the things that are coming, and that shall come to pass, let them declare [Isa. 44:7].

Next He allays our fear of those who disagree with us, stating that they will not be able to prevail against us in argument, nor be successful in producing convincing proof against us. That is the import of His subsequent remark: Be not afraid, neither fear ye; have I not announced unto thee of old and declared it? And ye are my witnesses. Is there a God beside Me? Yea, there is no Rock; I know not any (Isa. 44:8).

33. "skeptics"—Ibn Tibbon.

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

When He says: Be not afraid, He means: [Be not afraid] of the character of your opponents, of their numerical strength, their fearest continually all the day because of the fury of the oppressor lent to wë al tirë u (neither fear ye), for by the process of substituion the he may stand in place of the 'aleph. He means thereby that their arguments in themselves. This is borne out by what He says be afraid of their words (Ezek. 2:6). In a similar vein it is said: He that feared the word of the Lord (Exod. 9:20).

God's statement, moreover, Have I not announced unto thee of old? (Isa. 44:8) refers to the prophetic revelations concerning the future. His remark again, And I declared (ibid.) has reference to the prophetic revelations concerning the past. Thus, too, does He say elsewhere: The former things, what are they? Declare ye, that we may consider, and know the end of them; or announce to us when the things to come (Isa. 41:22).

When, furthermore, He says: And ye are My witnesses (Isa. 44:8), He alludes to the marvelous signs and the manifest proofs forms, ³⁴ such as the visitation of the ten plagues and the cleaving I consider the case of the miracle of the manna as the most amazing cites greater wonderment than one of a passing ³⁵ character. Aye numbering something like two million souls could be nourished in the air by the Creator. For had there been any possibility the philosophers of old would have been the first to resort to it.

34. "forms"—Ibn Tibbon and M. 35. "Passing"—Ibn Tibbon and M.

Universita Karlóva v Praze Knihovas filozofie FF

They would have maintained their disciples therewith, taught them wisdom, and enabled them to dispense with working for a livelihood or asking for help.

Now it is not likely ³⁶ that the forbears of the children of Israel should have been in agreement upon this matter if they had considered it a lie. Such [proof] suffices, then, as the requisite of every authentic tradition. Besides, if they had told their children: "We lived in the wilderness for forty years eating naught except manna," and there had been no basis $\langle 24 \rangle$ for that in fact, their children would have answered them: "Now you are telling us a lie. Thou, so and so, is not this thy field, and thou, so and so, is not this thy garden from which you have always derived your sustenance?" This is, then, something that the children would not have accepted by any manner of means.

His statement, again, Is there a God beside Me? (ibid.) means: "If, now, perchance you be afraid that some of the things, about which I have told you that they had come to pass or some of those concerning which I have told you that they would come to pass, are not true, [that fear on your part might be justified] if a creation had been effected by someone else than Me. In that event I might perhaps not have been posted on what he was making. But inasmuch as I am One, My knowledge embraces everything that I have made and that I will make."

Finally under His statement, And there is no rock (sur) that I do not know ³⁷ (ibid.) are subsumed the distinguished men of the human race and its sages. For the expression sur may be applied to great men. Scripture says, namely: Look unto the rock (sur) whence ye were hewn and to the hole of the pit whence ye were digged. Look unto Abraham your father, and unto Sarah that bore you (Isa. 51: 1, 2). It says also: Yea, thou makest the rock (sur) turn back his sword, and hast not made him to stand in the battle ³⁸ (Ps. 89: 44). What is meant by the verse under discussion is therefore: "There is no wise or distinguished man that I do not

36. "not likely"-Ibn Tibbon and M.

37. The usual translation is: Yea, there is no Rock; I know not any.

38. These quotations are given as in Ibn Tibbon.

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

31 know. Hence it is impossible that he should be able to produce an argument against you in the matter of your religion or do injury to your creed, because My knowledge is all-embracing and I have imparted it to you."

In this way, then—may God be merciful unto thee—do we conduct our speculation and inquiry, to the end that we may expound concretely by means of rational intuition and logical inference there is intimately bound up a point that we cannot avoid [bringreligious belief, as imparted to us by our Master, can be attained by means of research and correct speculation, what was the reason prophecy and support them by means of visible proofs and ³⁹ miracles rather than intellectual demonstrations?"

He addressed His messenger in our presence, and made it an obnot possibly reject. Thus He said: Ye yourselves have seen that I ing them about which no doubt could prevail and which we could have talked with you from heaven (Exod. 20: 19). Furthermore afforded us a quick relief from all these burdens by sending us His letting us see with our own eyes the signs and the proofs supportmessengers through whom He transmitted messages to us, and by befuddle him. That is why God, exalted and magnified be He, come by worry or overwhelmed by uncertainties that confuse and not succeed in making use of its conclusions because he is overthe process because of some flaw in his reasoning. Again he might use of its conclusions. But many a one of us might never complete the process of reasoning was completed by us so that we could make remained without religious guidance whatever for a while, until quaintance with His religion to that art alone, we would have ure of <25> time. If, therefore, He had referred us for our acspeculation could be attained only in the course of a certain measexalted be He, an adequate answer. We say, then, [that] the All-Wise knew that the conclusions reached by means of the art of To this question we should like to give, with the help of God,

39. "and"-Ibn Tibbon.

hear when I speak with thee, and may also believe thee forever ligation to believe him forever, as He said: That the people may (Exod. 19: 9).

and we feel compelled to acknowledge God's Torah [that has alconclusions. We must, therefore, persevere in this standpoint 40 our speculation until we would arrive thereby at these selfsame ears have heard. ready been authenticated] by what our eyes have seen and our until the arguments in favor of it have become convincing for us, authenticity had been proven by the testimony of the senses. Its we shall explain. Now God commanded us to take our time with transmitted because of the attestation of authentic tradition, as acceptance is also incumbent upon anybody to whom it has been religion, together with all that was embraced in it, because its Thus it became incumbent upon us immediately to accept the

sible faith, for the knowledge of the senses is common to all men. acles and marvels are mentioned. children and the women together with the fathers whenever mirtoo, dost thou often see Him include in the Torah < 26 > the no aptitude for speculation can thus also have a perfect and accesance. Furthermore women and young people and those who have some impediment will, then, not remain without religious guidworry. He who is held back from engaging in such an activity by Praised, then, be the All-Wise, who ordered things thus. Therefore, indulges in speculation to complete his speculation, he is without So, then, even if it should take a long time for one of us who

six, and 14% to each of seven, and 121/2 to each of eight, and 11% to each of nine, and who wishes to check with them quickly on how drachmas weighs out 20⁴¹ to each of five men, and 16²/₃ to each of compare the situation to that of a person who out of a total of 1,000 to 500 drachmas, supporting his statement by the weight of the much money is left. So he tells them that the remainder amounts Next I say, in further elucidation of this matter, that one might

religion 40. "standpoint," i.e., that of the acceptance of the teachings of the Jewish

41. "20"-so according to Landauer's emendation.

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

he might encounter. understanding, and the effort he can put into it and the obstacles ment. Then they can take their time until they find out [that] it found to be 500 drachmas, they are compelled to credit his statemoney. Once, then, it has been weighed by them ⁴² quickly and [is really so] by way of calculation, each one according to his ω

children of Israel God never left His creatures without a religion tician is able by means of [his] investigations to check the matter.43 pathological conditions, designates it by a natural symptom upon being informed about an illness accompanied by certain [whereby it may be] immediately [recognized], until the diagnos-It behooves us also to believe that even before the era of the One might further compare this case to that of a person who,

dren (Gen. 18: 19). For I have known him, to the end that he may command his chilauthenticity by what he had perceived with his sense of vision. He, about one of these [who lived before the rise of a Jewish nation]: grasped by means of his sense of hearing. Thus the Torah says again, to whom it was transmitted, was convinced by what he had Whoever witnessed the latter in person was convinced of their fortified by prophecy and miraculous signs and manifest proofs.

MI

ple say: "The truth is burdensome. The truth is bitter." For they and run away from it. That is the reason why thou seest many peoproof and be applied practically in religious life, they take flight that ought to be confirmed and corroborated by means of logical some. When, namely, they perceive instinctively a certain matter of these is that human beings find the effort to be naturally burden-Of these I consider eight as being particularly prevalent. The first from engaging in speculation about religious doctrines. <27>the principal causes responsible for keeping infidels and heretics from believing [in the authenticity of] miracles and marvels, and To this statement I should like to append what occur to me to be

42. "them"-m. Cf. Landauer p. 26, n. 6.

43. "matter"-literally "his quest."

desire freedom [from such burdens] and so they fiee from them.⁴⁴ Of such persons does Scripture say: Get you far from the Lordl Unto us is this land given for an inheritance (Ezek. 11: 15). They do not realize, these thoughtless individuals, that if they were [consistently] to obey their natural instinct in its tendency to avoid exertion and effort, they would starve to death by virtue of failing to cultivate [the soil] or to build [homes].

The second is ignorance which predominates among many men. [There are, namely, people] who express themselves foolishly, are lazy in their thinking, and say unreflectingly: "There is nothing at all." And this is what they meditate inwardly also. Of such does Scripture say: Surely now shall they say: "We have no king; for we feared not the Lord; and the king; what can he do for us?" (Hos. 10:3). Nor do they consider the fact that if they were to make such inane statements and wild utterances about human rulers, they would court death and destruction.

The third [cause of heresy] is the inclination of the average man toward the gratification of his appetites, such as greediness for every [type of] food and sexual intercourse and acquisition. [On account of this tendency] he hurls himself into such activities hastily [and] without deliberation. It is of individuals of this character that Scripture says: *The fool hath said in his heart*: "*There is no God*." (Ps. 53: 2). A person of this type does not bear in mind the fact that if he were to act in such a manner in the event of illness—nay even when he is well—eating whatever he lusted for and cohabiting with whomever he found, he would perish therefrom and die.

The fourth [cause of heresy] is an aversion to speculation and an incapacity for listening attentively and engaging in sustained thinking [All this causes the individual] to be easily contented and say: "I have already looked into the matter and this is all I got out of it." Of such a one does Scripture say: The slothful man (rēmiyyah) shall not hunt <28 > his prey; but the precious substance of men is to be diligent (Prov. 12: 27). The meaning of [this word] rēmiyyah is "one who is without ambition." Such a one does not attain what he needs. Those belonging to this class do not realize

44. "from them"-Ibn Tibbon

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

that, if they were to employ such tactics in their worldly affairs, they would never be successful in them.

The fifth [cause] is arrogance and conceit, by which a person is so dominated as not to concede the existence of any wisdom that might be hidden from him or of any science that still has to be in the pride of his countenance saith: "He will not require." All his thoughts are: There is no God. (Ps. 10:4). This type of inbut little good in the fashioning of a signet ring or in the writing of a letter of the alphabet.

The sixth [cause of heresy] may be a word that a person hears from the mouth of the godless that touches his heart and unnerves it, so that he remains for the rest of his life in this state of nervous prostration, occasioned by this word. It is of such persons that and they go down into the innermost parts of the belly (Prov. 18:8). But why doesn't this [sort of individual] likewise consider so that they do not react against him, they [too] would destroy and kill him?

The seventh [cause of heresy] may be some weak, ridiculous argument [in favor of the true belief] that one has heard propounded by a certain monotheist, and that one believes to be typical of all [arguments of this order]. Of persons thus [misled] them (II Chron. 30: 10). Now it does not enter the mind of this sort of individual that the fact that a dealer in fine linens does not diminish their worth.

The eighth, finally, is the animosity existing between a man and certain monotheists. The unfortunate situation causes him to hate, together with his enemies, also their Master whom the latter wor-45. "costly"—Ibn Tibbon. The Arabic text uses the adjective *dabikiyyah*, i.e., a *buch*, ed. F. Wuestenfeld, II, 548), which was world-renowned during the Abbasid period. (See Hitti, *History of the Arabi*, [London 1937], p. 346.)

perpetuity to painful torment. of bringing upon him [so great] an evil as he has brought upon away by their feelings] that Scripture declares: My zeal hath un-119:139). Such a fool does not realize that his enemy is incapable done me, because mine adversaries have forgotten Thy words (Ps. ship. It is of persons [who permit themselves to be] thus [carried himself, since it is not within his enemy's power to subject him in

the welfare of those that venture into this discussion. chapter. I shall discourse about them according to my ability, and and related subjects will be taken up individually by me in the respective treatises to which they belong and in the appropriate punishment. [For the benefit of such let me state that] all these of the rule of the infidels, or who notes how death indiscriminately gathers in all creatures, or who is unable to grasp with his mind not punished, or who takes exception to the continued existence I hope, if God, exalted be He, is willing, to contribute thereby to the meaning of God's unity or that of the soul or of reward and was not granted. Or [there may be one] who sees evildoers who are answer from Him or that he had made a request of Him which jectionable, or that he had prayed to his Master and received no of the Bible <29> he noted something that he regarded as obdue to the fact that in the course of his interpretation of the verses There may, however, exist a person the error of whose way is

VIII

as I have stated previously. say in each case, after which will be presented the rational proofs, subject, it being noted first what the books of prophecy have to of its treatises. This is to be followed by an elaboration upon each proper to make mention of the aim of this book and the number And now that our discussion has reached this point, I deem it

consists is ten. I say, then, that the total number of treatises of which this book

The first treatise [aims to prove] that the world, together with all that is in it, was created in time.

DOUBT AND CERTAINTY

The second treatise [aims to prove] that the Creator, may His greatness be magnified, is one. ς Υ

The third treatise [is concerned with proving] that He, exalted hibitions. be He, has issued to mankind commandments as well as pro-

The fourth treatise [deals] with [the subjects of] obedience and disobedience [to God].

The fifth treatise [deals] with good and evil deeds.

The sixth treatise [deals] with the soul and the state of death and the hereafter.

The eighth treatise [deals] with the redemption of the children The seventh treatise [deals] with the resurrection of the dead. of Israel.

The ninth treatise [deals] with reward and punishment.

The tenth treatise [discusses] the question of the best possible behavior for man in [this] nether abode.

attentive and near at hand. my aspirations on behalf of His people and His saints, for He is beseech God to make even our path and to enable me to realize by prophecy bearing on the subject of the treatise in question. On tion of] such diverging views as have been reported to me. In each roboration is furnished by reason. This is to be followed by [a citabehalf of myself, as well as of anyone who studies this book, I the arguments against it. I shall conclude with the proofs furnished instance there will be given a statement of the thesis as well as of what has been imparted to us by our Lord and of whatever cor-<30> In each treatise I shall begin with [an exposition of]